



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: September 14, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0181
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 210 E. Magnolia Ave.

Owner: Jodie Bass
210 E. Magnolia Ave.
Louisville, KY 40208
(917) 957-1522
soulpropllc@gmail.com

Applicant: same as owner

Estimated Project Cost: \$71,700.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a new, two-story, three-car (one double door, and one single door) garage/carriage house on the footprint of the previous structure. The design will include a spa/gym area that will be approximately 600 sqft., and a garage that will be approximately 720 sqft. on the ground floor, and guest suite/apartment on the second level to be approximately 1248 sqft. with a balcony greenhouse and lower level screened in porch (not included in approximate sqft.). It will be approximately 33' – 2" W x 40' – 8" D x 22' – 7" H with a low slope (1:12) shed style roof, with a TPO floating material, clad with solar array. The exterior of the building will be primarily clad with a smooth finished stucco as well as a portion of the first level on the north and west elevations that will be raked finish stucco. The perforated metal material used for balcony railing is also proposed for the fencing, and a gate to allow access and enclose the west side of the property. There is an emphasis on sustainable design with the use of solar array and passive solar energy.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 16, 2021 and considered requiring committee level review on August 16, 2021. The case was scheduled to be heard

by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on September 22, 2021 at 4:30 pm, via WebEx video conference. The case was rescheduled to give the applicant more time to create revised drawings.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Old Louisville Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on October 13, 2021 at 4:30 pm, via WebEx video conference.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Old Louisville Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Garage, Site, and New Construction Residential**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is zoned TNZD in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The site is located at the first lot east of S. Brook Street on the south side of E. Magnolia Avenue. The 1895 structure is wood frame 1½-story Victorian residence surrounded by other 1½- to 2-story residences of the same era.

Previous COA work

2019- Old Louisville ARC approved **19COA1002** to replace the existing porch overhang, replace fencing, replacement of vinyl siding on sides and rear and fiber cement on the front façade, roof replacement, repair of stained glass window, and new corrugated metal on the roof and siding of the outbuilding.

2005- Staff approved **S-05-196-OL** the replacement of double-hung wood windows on the sides and rear of the home.

1990- Committee approved **A-90-4-OL** the installation of vinyl on the sides and rear of the building and denied approval of vinyl on the front façade.

1990- Staff approved **S-90-7-OL** the replacement of Insulbrick siding with smooth, non-grained vinyl siding on the duplex house at the rear of the property as well as the repair of door, window, corner, and ridge board trim with wood to be painted to match existing.

Conclusions

The proposed project generally meets the Old Louisville Preservation District design guidelines. The applicant originally applied for demolition of the historic double shotgun located at the rear of the property. The structure is shown starting on the 1905-1922 Sanborn Map. Based on research from city directories, the building was inhabited primarily by African Americans beginning in 1901, making its construction date believed to be 1900. The alley is still open to vehicle traffic. All other buildings along the alley are primarily garages and appear to be approximately mid-century or newer, so the historic context of the alley has been heavily altered.

When the current owner purchased the property there was an inspection of the double shogun by a structural engineer, and it was found to be structurally unsound. The building was declared an emergency demolition (BLD-WRE-21-00303) on September 23, 2021.

The proposed project generally meets the Old Louisville Preservation District, design guidelines for **Garage**. It meets all the applicable guidelines other than the ones calling for a single car door. As well as the use of a low sloped roof. A double-car door is proposed but is not flush and is broken up with articulated panels. There is a mix of garage doors along the alley, some are double-car, and some are single-car. The proposed use of one of each maintains the existing context of the doors along the alley.

The proposed project generally meets the Old Louisville Preservation District, design guidelines for **Site**. The new garage will have the same general setback from the alley and help to further enclose the rear yard. Historic limestone curbing does not appear to still be in place in this location, but if discovered shall be retained.

The proposed project generally meets the Old Louisville Preservation District, design guidelines for **New Construction Residential**. The plans for the new garage/carriage house incorporate simple, clean, modern design elements as a reflection of the time period it is proposed to be constructed in. The main conflicts are with NC24, NC25, NC26, and NC42 are regarding the proposed low slope roof. Also, in conflict is NC40 in terms of the use of the double-garage door. There are other double garage doors in the alley. The alley is also very narrow and the use of a single car garage door could create a pinch point for larger vehicles.

Recommendation

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness **with the following conditions:**

1. If historic limestone curbing is uncovered during the construction process, it shall be retained.
2. All wood shall be opaque painted or stained within 6 months of construction.
3. There shall be a gutter system installed.
4. All grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
5. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.
6. Applicant shall make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles.
7. Applicant shall incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
8. All other required permits or approvals for construction shall be obtained prior to construction beginning.

Bradley Fister
Bradley Fister

10/06/2021
Date

Garage

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	NA	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		+	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
	Roof	NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
		NA	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Use of TPO floating roof and Solar array
		NA	Metal roofing	
		NSI	Half-round or Ogee gutters	See conditions of approval
		NA	Approved Gable-end element	
		NA	No membrane roofing on sloped roofs.	
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
	Roof	NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
		-	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	Appears to be a low slope roof
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		NSI	Half-round gutters	See conditions of approval
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	

		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	-/+	Single-car openings	Both a double-car and single-car opening
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	Articulated panels/ and glass
		-	No double and triple doors	Double door
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	+	Use window openings to break up wall surface	Windows on all elevations
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	NSI	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	

ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	Applicant shall comply to all other municipal regulations.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The design generally meets the design guidelines.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+	The scale generally does not conflict with the character of the neighborhood
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+	The proposed design generally displays a high level of craftsmanship
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	The proposed materials generally are compatible with surrounding structures.
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	The design generally reinforces human scale.
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	The views are primarily to an alley
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	Generally the existing patterns are not changed
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	+	
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	+	
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+	Proposed design has openings on all elevations.

NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	NA	
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	
NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	NA	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Generally is compatible in height
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	+	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	The applicant shall maintain historic setback patterns.
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+/-	Proposed roof is low slope
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+/-	Proposed roof is low slope
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+/-	Proposed roof is generally parallel with others along the alley
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	Located along alley
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	Roof tops shall remain uncluttered
NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	Applicant shall make provisions for screening

NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+	The use of stucco generally meets this guideline.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	NA	
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+	Per drawings the foundation is covered with stucco
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+	Design generally is complementary
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	Proposed garage is adjacent to the alley
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	Proposed design has both
NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	The roofline is generally parallel with the main structure.
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	-	Proposed pitch is believed to be low.
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	Parking access is off the alley
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	Applicant shall incorporate storm-water management.