



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Katherine Groskreutz, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 11, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0228
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2347 Frankfort Ave.

Applicant: Amleto Acquaviva
Acquaviva Enterprises
309 E. Market St. #503
Louisville, KY 40202
502-609-6040
theoddshop@ymail.com

Owner: Taghezadeh Esmaeil
2311 Mohican Hill Ct.
Louisville, KY 40207
502-552-5365
etaghiz@gmail.com

Representative: Mike Prestigiaco
2312 Steeplechase Dr.
Louisville, KY 40299
502-753-9051
mike@presti-use.com

Estimated Project Cost: +/- \$14,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing front façade windows with new windows. The existing windows on the left are a double gang of non-historic, single-lite, fixed wood windows in an opening that has been shortened from the historic opening prior to Clifton becoming a historic preservation district. The existing windows on the right are three, historic, 16-lite, awning style metal windows. The applicant proposes to reopen the historic opening on the left, and

replace all front window openings with one, single-lite, fixed window in the three openings on the right and a double gang on the left.

The applicant is also requesting approval to remove the existing front façade garage door and replace it with the garage door currently on the east side of the building. A commercial, ADA-compliant storefront entry system with full-lite double door, three transom windows, and single-lite side windows are proposed for the east façade garage door opening.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 24, 2021 and considered requiring committee level review on September 27, 2021. Staff conducted a site visit on October 6, 2021 to assess the building and current condition of the windows.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on Wednesday, October 20, 2021 at 5:30 pm via WebEx web conference.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Storefront** and **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the north side of Frankfort Avenue, four and five lots east of the intersection with N. Keats Avenue. The property is zoned C2 within the Traditional Marketplace Corridor Form District. The site contains a one-story masonry commercial building that was initially constructed prior to 1887 and received a façade change in the 1920s of formed, rusticated concrete block and a stepped parapet wall. It was originally a blacksmith shop/horseshoe repair through 1921. It was later adapted for auto repair which it remained up through the last tenant. A side storefront office addition was added to the east in the mid-20th century. The building is being renovated to accommodate new commercial retail space. The parcel is surrounded by mix of historic homes and new and historic commercial buildings of various styles and massing. Railroad tracks are directly adjacent to the north.

Conclusions

The proposed garage door changes generally meet the Clifton design guidelines for **Storefront**. The garage door currently on the east façade has a higher proportion of glass to solid and will provide a better level of pedestrian interaction with the storefront than the existing garage door. It will allow the tenant to open the door for flexibility of the space. The front garage door historic opening size will be maintained, and the materials are similar between the two garage doors. The new storefront double door and windows system will fit the existing east side garage

door opening, will create a pedestrian friendly and ADA-compliant entrance from the parking lot, and is of an appropriate design and material for a commercial application within the district.


The window replacement proposal somewhat meets the requirements set forth by the Clifton design guidelines for **Storefront** and **Window**. Staff determined the windows are severely deteriorated and appropriate for replacement. The applicant will be reopening the full historic window opening on the left that was previously partially blocked in to shorten it. The glass in the 16-lite metal windows is also frosted and is not appropriate glass for a commercial retail building. Staff finds metal replacement windows in all four window openings are appropriate as the historic windows are metal rather than the non-historic wood window on the left. Metal windows will help retain the historic 1920s look of the building.

However, the proposed replacement windows only partially meet guidelines **SF1**, **SF6**, **SF7**, **SF17**, **SF20**, **W4** and **W8** and does not meet **W2**. Most of these call for replacement windows to match the same configuration and proportions as the existing. The proposed replacement windows do not match the existing or historic pattern that currently exists. The three historic 16-lite windows are character defining and are some of the only remaining historic fabric on the building, as the left windows that were likely a similar metal, multi-lite style were previously removed prior to Clifton becoming a historic preservation district. Staff suggests the applicant source windows through a company like Quaker Windows that can recreate windows in a similar metal framed style as the existing, but still provide energy efficiency. Staff would also suggest this type of window be installed in the left opening to help restore the front façade storefront if possible.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the storefront alterations be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. The applicant shall install replacement windows that match the existing window pane configurations and muntin proportions. Staff shall review window specifications for these openings prior to their ordering and installation.
2. The historic window and door openings shall be retained and not blocked in or enlarged to accommodate existing or stock windows and doors.
3. The glass shall be clear and shall not have a tinted, reflective, or insulating film. If a low-E coating is used, it shall be clear.
4. Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with **W2** shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.
5. All other required permits and approvals shall be acquired prior to construction.
6. If the design or materials change, Staff shall be contacted for review and approval.


 Katherine Groskreutz
 Historic Preservation Specialist

10/11/2021
 Date

Storefront

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines
 +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF1	When restoring or renovating an historic storefront include the following storefront elements if they previously existed: large display windows and doors, transoms, relatively thin framing elements, a cornice element separating the storefront from the upper façade, low bulkheads, and tile entry flooring.	+/-	The large openings are being maintained, but different window pane configuration than the 16-lite existing
SF2	Ornamental materials and features that contribute to the historic and architectural character of the building should not be removed from storefronts. Examples of these materials include wood, cast iron, terra cotta, Carrara glass, Vitrolite structural glass, ceramic tile, and brick.	NA	
SF3	When historic storefronts must be replaced in part or in whole, historic materials should be used or replaced with like materials. Appropriate materials for storefront replacement may include cast iron, limestone, brick, wood, and some synthetic materials.	+	Metal windows and doors proposed to be replaced with metal
SF4	Rough-textured wood siding or simulated masonry, such as permastone, should not be used on storefronts.	NA	Historic formed, rusticated concrete block already existing on the front façade
SF5	When cornice replacement is required in part or in whole, historic materials should be used or replaced with like materials.	NA	
SF6	All historic storefront elements should be retained, including later alterations that are historically appropriate in their own right during the period of significance for the district. An example is a late 1900's storefront with Art Deco features or other ornamental details added during the 1930s.	+/-	See conclusions
SF7	Façade alterations that have attained historic or architectural significance in their own right should be preserved. Such elements should be incorporated into any new storefront design or renovation. If there is insufficient physical or documentary evidence, do not attempt to recreate a falsely historic or conjectural historic design.	+/-	Historic window and door openings and material to remain the same; However, 16-lite historic window configuration proposed to be replaced with single-lite windows
SF8	Later historically significant materials should not be removed to restore a building to an earlier period. For example, a 1910 storefront should not be taken back to a conjectural 1850s appearance.	NA	
SF9	When renovating historic storefronts, the original scale, proportion, and organization of architectural elements (bulkheads, display windows, transoms, door, piers, cornices, and other ornamental details) should be preserved.	+	The large openings are being maintained
SF10	If extensive deterioration requires complete reconstruction, the original form and detailing of a storefront should be used as a model. The reconstruction should convey the same visual appearance and use the same material as the original. An historic storefront should not be removed and not replaced.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	How ever, an adaptive reuse for a commercial use may be considered.		
SF11	When reconstructing an historic storefront, historic, pictorial, and physical documentation should be used. The design may be an accurate restoration, if sufficient evidence exists, or a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, materials, style, and character of the historic building and the district.	NA	
SF12	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	+	
SF13	Replacement storefront designs should be compatible with and complementary to adjacent historic buildings and the district, but be recognized as being of their own era.	NA	
SF14	The storefront design should retain its original openings. Transitions from one façade to another should be clean and clearly defined.	+	
SF15	When implementing new designs or renovations, emphasize the transparent character of storefronts. Generally, 60 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level (first floor) should be transparent (window and door glass). Historically, merchandise seen in storefront displays was emphasized to a much greater extent than any ornament on the storefront itself.	+	The window and door openings will be retained or restored to their historic size; the garage door change and new east side storefront entry system will create more transparency
SF16	Reflective or insulating film should not be applied to window glass.	NA	Clear glass
SF17	Smoked, tinted, low -E, or reflective glass should not be used on building façades that can be seen from a public way. Spandrel glass, lightly tinted glass, or certain frosted glasses may be appropriate in certain design instances. Blinds or insulating curtains may be added for privacy and thermal performance.	+/-	Low-E, clear coating
SF18	Replacement doors should be selected that reflect the storefront's original character. Doors should have large glass panels and be made of wood or painted steel or aluminum. They should not be overly-decorated or possess inappropriate historic features (example: no stained glass).	+	
SF19	The storefront main entrance location should not be changed or reoriented.	+	The front entrances will remain, a new entrance will be added to the east side
SF20	Even if the use has changed, the storefront commercial character should be maintained.	+/-	Historic window and door openings and material to remain the same; However, 16-lite historic window configuration proposed to be replaced with single-lite windows
SF21	Historic architectural elements should not be added to storefronts that have no historic precedent. Common examples of inappropriate alterations include the installation of coach lanterns, false mansard designs, small-paned windows, inoperable shutters, or colonial doors on late-nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings.	NA	
SF22	False fronts, false stories, or pent eaves to roofs (false dormers) should not be added to commercial buildings.	NA	
SF23	Awnings should be designed with solid colors or with stripes running perpendicular to the building.	NA	
	Windows -Awnings		
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	Staff determined the front façade windows to be severely deteriorated and supports replacement
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	-	The proposed replacement windows are single pane in place of historic 16-lite windows; the replacements are proposed to be metal and maintain/restore the historic openings
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	The replacement windows will fit in the maintained/restored historic openings

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	New commercial, ADA-compliant storefront door and window system proposed for an existing garage door opening on the east side façade; an appropriate replacement and location for a commercial establishment requiring more egress and ADA accessibility
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	+/-	See conditions of approval
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	See conditions of approval
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	See conditions of approval
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	NA	
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	NA	
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	NA	
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	NA	
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	NA	
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	NA	
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	