



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: October 12, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0059
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2115 Frankfort Ave.

Applicant: Rachel Steele
Buffalo Construction Inc.
12700 Otto Knop Dr.
Louisville, KY 40299
502.753.6624
803.465.3605
Rachel.steele@buffaloconstruction.com

Owner: Roberty Podgursky
SAL Properties LLC
21 Beach Place
Maplewood, NJ 07040
917-749-1251
rpodgursky@hotmail.com

Designer: Tom Kargl
DKN Architects
716 Ease Market St.
Louisville, KY 40202
502.426.7452
tekargl@dknarchitects.com

Estimated Project Cost: \$200,000

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing 2 storefront windows on the commercial warehouse structure with new roll up glass garage doors. The applicant also seeks approval to replace the existing side window with a sliding

drive-thru window. The applicant seeks after-the-fact approval for the storefront awnings, signage, and paint.

Paint color on previously painted masonry in the Clifton Preservation District, is not subject to landmark approval and thus considered general maintenance per the Clifton Design Guidelines.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on March 24, 2021. The application was determined to be in complete and requiring more information before being able to move forward. The applicant provided more detailed information and amended the original application to add the after the fact awnings, signage, and paint on 09-29-21. The application was then considered to be complete and requiring committee approval. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee on Wednesday October 20, at 5:30PM online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Storefront, Sign, and Windows**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The site zoned C2 is located in a Traditional Market Place corridor on the north side of Frankfort Avenue three lots east of Vernon Avenue. It is one-story masonry warehouse/commercial structure with a clerestory surrounded by other commercial structures.

Conclusions

The proposed project generally meets the Clifton Design Guidelines for **Storefront SF1, SF13-SF17, SF19-SF21, and SF23, Windows W1-W4, W6, W7, W9, W10, W17-W21 and Signage SG1-SG3, SG5, SG7, SG11, and SG15**. The storefront windows proposed for replacement are not the original windows. The proposed rollup garage door style windows are similar in style to other windows that open on storefront facades in the district. The proposed replacement of the side window, for a drive-thru window will be replacing a window that was previously replaced and is not on a primary elevation. The after-the-fact awnings generally meet the design guidelines, and help to break up the otherwise flat façade, while also providing a functional purpose to block a portion of the intense sunlight that washes over the building a large part of the day. The proposed signage generally meets the Clifton Design Guidelines for signage. The sign appears to be mounted and generally the same size as a previous sign attached to the building.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be approved with the following conditions:

1. Applicant shall submit final window cut sheets to staff for approval.
2. Reflective or insulating film should not be applied to window glass.
3. Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass should not be used on building façades that can be seen from a public way. Low-E is acceptable if it is clear.
4. The applicant shall formally apply for a sign permit separate of their COA.
5. All future signage must be submitted for a sign permit and review prior to installation.
6. If the proposal changes or additional work is proposed the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval prior to installation.
7. The applicant shall obtain any necessary building permits.

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

10-12-21

Date

Attached Documents / Information

1. Design Guideline Checklist

Storefront

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines NA Not Applicable
- Does Not Meet Guidelines NSI Not Sufficient Information
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF1	When restoring or renovating an historic storefront include the following storefront elements if they previously existed: large display windows and doors, transoms, relatively thin framing elements, a cornice element separating the storefront from the upper façade, low bulkheads, and tile entry flooring.	+	The proposed new front façade window configuration generally conforms to the design guidelines. The existing windows were replaced in 2019.
SF2	Ornamental materials and features that contribute to the historic and architectural character of the building should not be removed from storefronts. Examples of these materials include wood, cast iron, terra cotta, Carrara glass, Vitrolite structural glass, ceramic tile, and brick.	NA	
SF3	When historic storefronts must be replaced in part or in whole, historic materials should be used or replaced with like materials. Appropriate materials for storefront replacement may include cast iron, limestone, brick, wood, and some synthetic materials.	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SF4	Rough-textured wood siding or simulated masonry, such as permastone, should not be used on storefronts.	NA	
SF5	When cornice replacement is required in part or in whole, historic materials should be used or replaced with like materials.	NA	
SF6	All historic storefront elements should be retained, including later alterations that are historically appropriate in their own right during the period of significance for the district. An example is a late 1900's storefront with Art Deco features or other ornamental details added during the 1930s.	NA	
SF7	Façade alterations that have attained historic or architectural significance in their own right should be preserved. Such elements should be incorporated into any new storefront design or renovation. If there is insufficient physical or documentary evidence, do not attempt to recreate a falsely historic or conjectural historic design.	NA	
SF8	Later historically significant materials should not be removed to restore a building to an earlier period. For example, a 1910 storefront should not be taken back to a conjectural 1850s appearance.	NA	
SF9	When renovating historic storefronts, the original scale, proportion, and organization of architectural elements (bulkheads, display windows, transoms, door, piers, cornices, and other ornamental details) should be preserved.	+	The proposed front façade windows fit in the existing openings.
SF10	If extensive deterioration requires complete reconstruction, the original form and detailing of a storefront should be used as a model. The reconstruction should convey the same visual appearance and use the same material as the original. An historic storefront should not be removed and not replaced. However, an adaptive reuse for a commercial use may be considered.	NA	
SF11	When reconstructing an historic storefront, historic, pictorial, and physical documentation should be used. The design may be an accurate restoration, if sufficient evidence exists, or a new design that is compatible with the size, scale, materials, style, and character of the historic building and the district.	NA	
SF12	Architectural features that are proposed for reconstruction or replacement must be photographically documented by the property owner as part of the application submitted to Landmarks for approval of any exterior modification. Historic elements cannot be removed until after approval has been obtained.	NA	
SF13	Replacement storefront designs should be compatible with and complementary to adjacent historic buildings and the district, but be recognized as being of their own era.	+	Proposed windows that roll up are similar in style to others in the area.
SF14	The storefront design should retain its original openings. Transitions from one façade to another should be clean and clearly defined.	+	
SF15	When implementing new designs or renovations, emphasize the transparent character of storefronts. Generally, 60 percent of the wall surface at the sidewalk level (first floor) should be transparent (window and door glass). Historically, merchandise seen in storefront displays was emphasized to a much greater extent than any ornament on the storefront itself.	+	The proposed windows are to open completely allowing for indoor outdoor interaction.
SF16	Reflective or insulating film should not be applied to window glass.	+	Windows shall be clear
SF17	Smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass should not be used on building façades that can be seen from a public way. Spandrel glass, lightly tinted glass, or certain frosted glasses may be appropriate in certain design instances. Blinds or	+	Low-E is acceptable if it is clear

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	insulating curtains may be added for privacy and thermal performance.		
SF18	Replacement doors should be selected that reflect the storefront's original character. Doors should have large glass panels and be made of wood or painted steel or aluminum. They should not be overly-decorated or possess inappropriate historic features (example: no stained glass).	NA	
SF19	The storefront main entrance location should not be changed or reoriented.	+	Entrance remains
SF20	Even if the use has changed, the storefront commercial character should be maintained.	+	
SF21	Historic architectural elements should not be added to storefronts that have no historic precedent. Common examples of inappropriate alterations include the installation of coach lanterns, false mansard designs, small-paned windows, inoperable shutters, or colonial doors on late-nineteenth and twentieth-century buildings.	+	
SF22	False fronts, false stories, or pent eaves to roofs (false dormers) should not be added to commercial buildings.	NA	
SF23	Awnings should be designed with solid colors or with stripes running perpendicular to the building.	+	Awnings are solid
	Windows -Awnings		
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	+	Awnings are generally complementary to the overall building.
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	+	The material choice is in keeping with the character of the building.
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	+	The awnings generally appear to have been installed without causing damage to the building.
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	+	Awnings are generally located in keeping with the design guidelines.
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	+	Awnings are generally an appropriate height from pedestrian level.

Windows

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
 - Does Not Meet Guidelines
 +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions
- NA Not Applicable
 NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	The maintenance and repair of historic windows are essential to preserving the historic character and fabric of Clifton structures and the overall Clifton historic district. For that reason, historic windows on street-address façades and street-facing façades shall not be replaced with new windows unless the Clifton ARC determines that the condition of existing windows, safety or energy efficiency considerations, or other relevant factors support window	+	Front façade windows are not the original storefront windows.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	replacement. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.		
W2	If historic windows on façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades are replaced, or the owner is authorized to replace windows on street-address façade or street-facing façade pursuant to W1, the new windows shall convey the same visual appearance as the historic windows. The visual appearance of a window is based on details such as sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and other decorative features. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of wood, metal, or synthetic window systems for authorized window replacement is permissible. During the planning stage for possible window replacement on any façade, and prior to submittal of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement, property owners should consult with the Landmarks staff on the application of these guidelines to their structure, options for addressing the property owner's needs, and concerns regarding their windows.	+	The proposed new window on the side elevation is generally compatible with the structure.
W3	Replacement sash should not be used that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock-sized windows.	+	Windows shall fit existing openings on the front and side façades.
W4	Replacement windows proposed for façades other than street-address façades or street-facing façades, and those authorized pursuant to W1 for street-address façades and street-facing façades, shall operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	+/-	The proposed windows are a new design that is compatible with the structure.
W5	Thermal glazing windows that have muntins in accordance with W2 shall have such muntins permanently applied and may also incorporate internal dividers between the glass panes.	NA	
W6	Reflective or insulating film shall not be applied to window glass on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval.
W7	Smoked, tinted, or reflective glass shall not be used on windows on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	See conditions of approval.
W8	Transoms or sidelights shall not be blocked-in or back-painted.	NA	
W9	The number, size, location, or shape of original windows shall not be altered on street-address façades or street-facing façades by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+	Window configuration, location and size shall not change.
W10	Any new window openings for a new use shall not be located on street-address façades or street-facing façades.	+	Proposed sliding window is on the side façade.
W11	The front face of historic window trim shall not be covered with metal or siding material. Siding may butt up to the side of historic window trim.	NA	
W12	New floors or dropped ceilings shall not be installed that	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	block the glazed area of windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.		
W13	If exterior storm windows are installed they should duplicate the shape of the original window.	NA	
W14	When installing exterior storm windows or screens do not damage or obscure historic windows or frames.	NA	
W15	Window sashes shall not be altered to accommodate window air-conditioning units.	NA	
W16	When installing security bars do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W17	Awnings shall be designed to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	+	Awnings are generally complementary to the overall building.
W18	Awnings shall be of a material and form compatible with the building's historic character. Contemporary designs may be considered if compatible with the design and character of the building.	+	The material choice is in keeping with the character of the building.
W19	Awnings shall be installed in a way that does not harm the building. Limit hardware installation to that which is required for structural stability. Anchors shall be installed in mortar joints, not masonry units.	+	The awnings generally appear to have been installed without causing damage to the building.
W20	On commercial buildings attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings shall be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	+	Awnings are generally located in keeping with the design guidelines.
W21	Awnings shall be installed so that the valance is no lower than permissible by code (Building Code or Public Works).	+	Awnings are generally an appropriate height from pedestrian level.
W22	Replacement shutters should match the visual appearance, size, and location of the originals and may be constructed of wood, metal, or synthetic material.	NA	
W23	Shutters shall be installed only where there is historic evidence for them.	NA	

Sign

Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
SG1	Sign design should take into account its size, shape, and materials; where it will be positioned on the building; if and how it will be illuminated; and what style of lettering or typeface will be used.	+	The sign generally is appropriate in size, shape, and material.
SG2	Sign design should complement its surroundings, be integrated into the architectural design of the building, should not dominate the façade, should not obstruct architectural details, and should not interfere with adjacent buildings or existing trees and shrubs.	+	The sign is generally complementary to the building and street.
SG3	Sign design should be simple and easy to read, use a limited number of lettering styles and colors, and reflect the character of the business and/or the building.	+	The sign is simple and easily read.
SG4	Commercial flush-mounted signs should be designed equal	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	to or less than 2.5 feet in height. Lettering should be between 8 and 18 inches high and occupy around 65 percent of the sign board.		
SG5	Storefront-level signs should be scaled and oriented to pedestrians.	+	The sign is generally scaled and oriented for pedestrians.
SG6	Creative sign design may be accommodated with review and approval through the Clifton ARC review process.	NA	
SG7	Signs should be designed using, but not limited to, the following materials: painted or carved wood signs, painted wall signs, signs applied to canvas awnings, smooth-surface sheet metal signs, wrought iron signs, and lettering applied to glass using gold leaf, paint, or etching.	+	The sign generally meets the design guidelines in terms of material and design.
SG8	Commercial signs may be designed using neon or neon-like technology, but its use shall be limited in scale and size so as not to divert the attention of motorists.	NA	
SG9	Marquee signs may be used on any building that has been or is currently operating as a theater or hotel.	NA	
SG10	Free-standing or monument signs should be low to the ground and landscaped. Signs attached to a building are preferred in lieu of a free-standing sign.	NA	
SG11	Signs shall be limited to no more than two signs per building or one sign per tenant.	+	One sign exists
SG12	Billboards shall not be installed within the preservation district and existing billboards shall be removed whenever possible.	NA	
SG13	Commercial attached wall signs should be placed over the unadorned frieze of a cornice or along the top of the storefront below the sill of the second-story windows. For residences, attach signs near existing doorways or on porches.	NA	
SG14	Commercial flush-mounted signs should be placed above the display windows and below the second-story window sills.	NA	
SG15	Commercial hanging signs mounted perpendicular to the building's façade should project no more than 5 feet from the building or half the width of the sidewalk, whichever is less.	+	The sign generally meets this guideline.
SG16	Signs shall not be installed on roof-tops, along the roof ridge line, or above the cornice of buildings in the Frankfort Ave. commercial corridor.	NA	
SG17	Plastic, over-scaled, or internally illuminated fluorescent signs or awnings are prohibited. Individual lettering and small logos may be illuminated within an opaque background. Reader board signs or signs that flash, move, or have inappropriately scaled graphics are prohibited.	NSI	
SG18	Concealed lighting is recommended. Internally illuminated plastic box signs, bare spot lights, or high-wattage metal halide lights are prohibited.	NSI	