



---

## Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

### Report to the Committee

---

To: Clifton Architectural Review Committee  
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer  
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist  
Date: October 12, 2021

---

**Case No:** 21-COA-0185  
**Classification:** Committee Review

#### GENERAL INFORMATION

**Property Address:** 124 William St.

**Applicant:** William Lindsey Logan IV  
Excel Partners KY, LLC  
11004 Kings Crown Drive  
Prospect, KY 40059  
(502) 744-0123  
(606) 682-2575  
(502) 791-8797  
[excelpartnerskylc@gmail.com](mailto:excelpartnerskylc@gmail.com)  
[william.l.loganiv@gmail.com](mailto:william.l.loganiv@gmail.com)

**Owner:** Same as applicant

**Estimated Project Cost:** \$180,000.00

#### Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The new construction of an approximately 32'-5" +/- wide by approximately 45'-7" +/- deep, will be a single-family residence on a vacant lot. The two-story, wood framed, structure is proposed to be clad with lap siding (material TBD). The structure is proposed to be arranged as a two-story residence with a rear facing garage and parking pad accessible from the rear.

#### Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 19, 2021 and considered complete and requiring committee level review on August 23, 2021.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Clifton Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on October 20, 2021 at 5:30 pm, via WebEx video conference.

## **FINDINGS**

### **Guidelines**

The following design guidelines, approved for the Clifton Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction Residential**, and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

### **Site Context/ Background**

The vacant lot is zoned R6 in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District, and located seven lots south from the intersection of Frankfort Ave. and William St. The property is amongst circa 1900 single story shotguns some of which have camel back additions. There was previously a single-story lap sided residence on the property. According to the applicant, during renovations by a subcontractor to the interior of the residence an error was made which resulted in the building being demolished.

### **Conclusions**

The proposed single-family residence generally complies with the applicable design guidelines for **New Construction Residential**. It is proposed to be of appropriate scale and design (materials TBD) for the district as a whole. There will need to be further information provided to staff concerning the material selections as outlined in **NC13**, **NC14**, **NC30** and **NC31**.

The proposed concrete walkways generally conform with the applicable guidelines for **Site**. The overall site changes will have some impact from the front street views, but the front yard topography is not being changed. There are no existing trees on the lot. There is alley access and there is proposed off street parking.

## **RECOMMENDATION**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. **Applicant shall conform to all LDC regulations in terms of new construction including minimum tree requirement.**
2. **Any exposed wood shall be painted or stained within 6 months of construction.**
3. **The lap siding on the building shall be either 3" or 4" reveal running horizontally.**
4. **There shall be no flush eaves. Eaves shall project a minimum of 4" from the facades.**
5. **Final material selections shall be reviewed and approved by staff.**
6. **Exterior lighting shall not exceed 2.0 footcandles and shall be directed away from historic properties.**

7. All concrete work visible from public view shall be of historic concrete mix.
8. Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.
9. Excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building shall not be done which could cause damage or destroy significant archeological resources. Any archeological resources shall be reported to Landmarks staff.
10. Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
11. Any changes to the proposed design shall be submitted to staff for review.

10/12/2021

Date

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister

Historic Preservation Specialist

## New Construction - Residential

### Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>NCR1</b>	New construction designs should conform to all applicable regulations including the Land Development Code, Zoning District Regulations, Building, and Fire and Safety codes, MSD, and any other regulatory agency. All new construction architectural designs will be reviewed by the Clifton ARC.	+	The applicant shall be responsible to conform to all codes and regulations applicable.
<b>NCR2</b>	No structure should be demolished to make way for new or large-scale construction. All structures in the district will be identified as either contributing or non-contributing at time of application. The Landmarks staff and ARC will evaluate and review all demolition permit requests. See the Demolition guidelines for more details.	NA	
<b>NCR3</b>	Building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback should reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The proposed design generally adheres to these principles.
<b>NCR4</b>	The scale of new construction should not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	Scale is generally appropriate
<b>NCR5</b>	Building materials and design elements in new construction design should be sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	Proposed materials are in keeping with the surrounding buildings.
<b>NCR6</b>	Creative design is encouraged. Examples of materials to avoid include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unfinished wood, and asphalt siding. Chain-link fences should not be installed where visually incompatible.	+	Proposed design is simplistic yet generally appropriate for the street.
<b>NCR7</b>	New construction design should reflect and reinforce the human scale of the neighborhood, which is a character-defining feature of the preservation district.	+	Proposed design is in keeping with the surrounding scale.
<b>NCR8</b>	Important public views and vistas should not be disrupted by new construction design. See the Cultural Landscape guidelines for more details.	NA	
<b>NCR9</b>	Existing spatial patterns created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, should be reinforced in new construction design.	+	
<b>NCR10</b>	The spatial organization established by surrounding buildings should be reinforced in infill construction design. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly designed façades.	+	Proposed design generally relates to surrounding buildings.
<b>NCR11</b>	The façade's organization should closely relate to surrounding buildings in infill construction design. Cornice lines and columns are other important character-defining façade elements. Imitating an historic style or period of architecture in new construction is not recommended.	+	Generally relates to surrounding buildings.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>NCR12</b>	A new building's mass should have a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	Proposed mass is generally in keeping with the surrounding properties.
<b>NCR13</b>	Window patterns should be sympathetic with those of surrounding buildings. Compatible frame dimensions, proportion, panel and light, and muntin configurations are encouraged. Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one half (height) by one (width).	+	Proposed window patterns are similar.
<b>NCR14</b>	Front door design should be sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings in new construction design. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	+	Proposed front door design is simplistic like many of the neighboring properties.
<b>NCR15</b>	The orientation of the main entrance should be the same as the majority of other buildings on the street in new construction design.	+	Front entry orientation is generally the same as other residences on the street.
<b>NCR16</b>	Paved walks should be installed between public sidewalks and front entrances where this is a character-defining feature on the street.	-	This is not on the site plan and is character defining for the area.
<b>NCR17</b>	Handicapped access ramps should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) wherever possible. If the only option is to install the ramp on the street address façade, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible. Removable or portable ramps may also be used.	NA	
<b>NCR18</b>	Infill construction design should be compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	Height is comparable to surrounding buildings.
<b>NCR19</b>	Horizontal elements such as band boards, brick coursing, window sills or lintels in new construction design should be within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the similar height of the horizontal elements is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	NA	
<b>NCR20</b>	The historic rhythm of the streetscape should be maintained.	+	Generally maintained
<b>NCR21</b>	Historic building setback patterns should be maintained. To maintain the continuity of the streetscape, front setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	+	Proposed setback follows others on the street
<b>NCR22</b>	Roofs of new buildings should relate to neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	Proposed roof generally adheres to this guideline.
<b>NCR23</b>	Rooflines for infill construction design should follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+	The proposed roof design generally adheres to the surrounding buildings.
<b>NCR24</b>	The orientation of the main roof form in new construction design should be parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	The proposed front facing gable roof is typical of other buildings on the street.
<b>NCR25</b>	The existing cornice line on each block should be emphasized in new construction design where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
<b>NCR26</b>	Rooftops should remain uncluttered and mechanical systems should be obscured from public view in new construction design.	+	Plans do not show mechanicals on rooftop
<b>NCR27</b>	Trash receptacles should be screened from public view with a four-sided enclosure.	+	Applicant shall provide screening for trash receptacles
<b>NCR28</b>	Exterior sheathing should be compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Painted wood siding or fiber cement	+	The proposed lap siding is in keeping with the character of

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	board is preferred. Vinyl siding may be used for new construction on streets where the predominant historic construction material is wood. See Siding and Trim guidelines for additional details.		the street, proposed material TBD
<b>NCR29</b>	Masonry types and mortars should be compatible with surrounding buildings. Red brick is the most common masonry material found in the district. See Masonry guidelines for additional details.	NA	
<b>NCR30</b>	Stone or cast-stone sills and lintels should be incorporated into new construction design on streets where these elements are character-defining features.	NA	
<b>NCR31</b>	Raised masonry foundations which are compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings should be used. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+/-	The applicant proposes to take the siding to the ground level
<b>NCR32</b>	New front porches should be built on streets where they are a predominant character-defining feature, and are allowed on other streets, and should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. New columns should consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	There is a mix of properties with and without porches on this street.
<b>NCR33</b>	Porches on newly constructed buildings should be designed so the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the façade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	The proposed design does not have a front porch, however there are many homes on the street without front porches including the former residence.
<b>NCR34</b>	Storm-water management systems in new construction design and water runoff should not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions

## Site

### Clifton Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>ST1</b>	Paving materials (concrete, brick, paver stones, cobblestones, asphalt, gravel, stone, permeable or pervious materials) that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character should be used for private sidewalks, drives, and roadways.	+	Applicant shall be cautious when connecting to alley not to disturb any existing paving materials.
<b>ST2</b>	Historic paving materials for streets, alleys, sidewalks, and curbing (brick, hexagonal pavers, cobblestones, limestone, granite, or natural stone) should be protected, maintained, restored, and reused. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Replacement with historic materials is encouraged. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original. See Masonry M13 guideline for cement mortar mix recipe.	+	Applicant shall maintain any historic paving or curbing.
<b>ST3</b>	Steps on private property made of brick, stone, or poured concrete should be maintained wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	



	Guideline	Finding	Comment
<b>ST4</b>	Paving companies and utility contractors shall not harm historic resources during road or underground utility repair projects.	NA	
<b>ST5</b>	Driveways, parking areas, and loading docks should be constructed or located to the side and rear of properties. Alley access is preferred.	+	Proposed drive and parking is at rear of the property.
<b>ST6</b>	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not re-contour front yard berms into stepped terraces. Do not use railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	Proposed new construction does not change the front yard topography
<b>ST7</b>	Excavations, trenching or re-grading adjacent to a building or site should be performed cautiously so as not to cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources. Every reasonable effort shall be made to protect and preserve architectural resources affected by, or adjacent to, any project.	+	Applicant shall take precautions not to disturb neighboring foundations.
<b>ST8</b>	Masonry walls in street-visible locations should not be installed unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless an historic precedent exists.	NA	
<b>ST9</b>	Retaining wall and curbing should match the existing character of the original materials when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
<b>ST10</b>	Fencing should match existing sections of fencing in material, height, design, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
<b>ST11</b>	Iron fencing should be installed, historically compatible, and of a similar height where there is a demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
<b>ST12</b>	Front yard fencing should not be installed where there is no historic precedent.	+	Retaining wall and chain link fencing were historically on this property.
<b>ST13</b>	Rear yard or side yard privacy fencing should be installed with the finished side out and a side wall setback from the front of the house of at least two feet. Privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Refer to the Land Development Code or contact the Department of Codes and Regulations regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
<b>ST14</b>	Chain-link fencing painted black or dark color may be installed in residential front yards or along commercial corridors at the street where there is an historic precedent. Split-rail, woven-wood fencing, opaque fencing, painted or stained pressure-treated wood fencing, or recycled or reclaimed materials may be permitted with appropriate design. Synthetic or composite fencing that is durable may be considered.	NA	
<b>ST15</b>	Exterior lighting fixtures should not be falsely historical. The fixture should be attached to the exterior in a way as to not damage historic fabric.	+	Applicant shall present exterior lighting to staff for approval.
<b>ST16</b>	Exterior lighting for parking areas, architectural features, or other site areas should be directed down and away from neighboring properties. Energy-efficient lights should be used to create a soft illumination and to minimize the impact to adjacent properties. Reference the Land Development Code for illumination restrictions.	+	Applicant shall present exterior lighting to staff for approval.
<b>ST17</b>	Parking lot design requires a portion of the parking area to be landscaped or buffered from adjoining properties. Reference the Land Development Code for specifics on	NA	

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
	parking lot design, maneuvering, landscaping, and buffering requirements.		
<b>ST18</b>	Auxiliary fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, rain barrels, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, should be located on secondary elevations (side or rear) so they do not detract from the street-address façade and the character of the site.	+	Applicant shall locate exterior mechanical fixtures out of sight when possible.
<b>ST19</b>	Trees in front yards should be preserved. Established street tree patterns should be enhanced by planting additional trees along the public rights-of-way in the grass area between the street and sidewalk. Consult the city arborist or Frankfort Avenue Street Tree Master Plan to determine tree species that are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review by Landmarks staff unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety concerns.	NA	There are no existing trees
<b>ST20</b>	Cellular towers and associated fixtures should be strategically located to minimize the impact on historic view shed(s), screened from public view, and should not damage historic elements when attached to structures.	NA	
<b>ST21</b>	Utility lines should be installed underground whenever possible.	NA	
<b>ST22</b>	The concrete mixture should match the existing or historic concrete mixture when repairing or replacing sidewalks or installing new sidewalks in the public right-of-way. Contact the Landmarks staff for the appropriate mixture and specifications.	+	Historic concrete mix shall be used.