



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: November 1, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0221
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2126 Edgeland Ave.

Owner: Peter C. Brown
2126 Edgeland Ave.
Louisville, KY 40204
(502) 762-8324
Pbrown357357@gmail.com

Applicant: Same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$86,000.00

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to demolish an existing two car garage located in the rear yard.

The applicant also seeks approval to construct a new, one-story, three-car garage in the existing garage's place. It will be approximately 34' W x 26' D x 14" H with a 4:12 slope hipped roof with asphalt shingles. It will be clad in horizontal oriented lap siding. The garage will be constructed on a poured concrete foundation with a 4" concrete slab. A double car garage door and a single car garage door will face the alley. The person door will be located in the center wall on the side of the garage opposite the alley.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on September 22, 2021 and considered requiring committee level review on September 27, 2021.

The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on November 10, 2021 at 4:30 pm, via WebEx video conference.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition**, **Garage**, and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R5B zoned property in the Traditional Neighborhood Form District is located on the east side of Edgeland Ave., 17 lots north of the intersection with Bardstown Rd. The primary structure is a circa 1910, two-and-a-half-story, brick clad home with full front porch and large hip-roofed dormer. The surrounding buildings are predominately residential structures similar in style and from the same time period.

In 2020, a COA (20-COA-0137) was withdrawn when staff determined the proposed work to be general maintenance.

In 2013, a COA (13COA1113) was approved for the addition of a dormer that is not front facing to allow for greater head height for storage in the attic.

In 1991, EO-91-14-C found that 3 trees in the rear yard could be removed since they were dying.

Conclusions

The proposed project somewhat meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines for **Demolition**. A structure of the same relative size and location is shown on the 1928 Sanborn Map. However, the structure has been heavily modified including the addition of new lap siding, a new roof, new door, new windows, new concrete foundation walls, and new concrete floor which is not typical for early 20th century outbuildings. All other garages along this portion of the alley appear to be approximately mid-century or newer, so the historic context of the alley has been heavily altered.

Staff believes that based on these changes to the structure itself and its surroundings, the historic nature has been eroded enough for it to now be considered a non-contributing building and has outlived its useful life expectancy.

The proposed project generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, design guidelines for **Garage**. It meets all the applicable guidelines other than the ones calling for a single car door. A double car door is proposed, but it is not flush and is broken up with articulated panels. Almost all of the garage doors along the

alley are also double car, solid paneled doors, so it maintains the existing context of the doors along the alley.

The proposed project generally meets the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, design guidelines for **Site**. The new garage will have the same general setback from the alley and help to further enclose the rear yard. Historic Limestone curbing does appear to still be in place in this location, as well as brick paving is present and should be retained.

The plans for the new garage incorporate simple design elements as a reflection of the surrounding new garages. The proposed demolition and new garage construction meet most of the applicable guidelines and is generally appropriate for the district.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing garage be **approved with the following conditions**:

- 1. The applicant shall take care to retain the brick paving and limestone curbing.**
- 2. All other required permits or approvals for demolition shall be obtained prior to demolition beginning.**

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction be **approved with the following conditions**:

- 1. All wood shall be opaque painted or stained within 6 months of construction.**
- 2. All grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.**
- 3. The applicant shall take care to retain the brick paving and limestone curbing.**
- 4. Applicant shall make provisions to screen trash receptacles.**
- 5. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.**
- 6. All other required permits or approvals for construction shall be obtained prior to construction beginning.**

Bradley Fister

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

11/01/2021

Date

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist

From Economic Hardship Exemption

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

Introduction

Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect

The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+/-	The structure is shown on the 1928 Sanborn map but has been altered; the historic context of the alley is no longer intact based on the age, size, or heavy modification of other garages located along this portion of the alleyway
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	NA	
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	NA	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	A new garage will be built along the alley

GARAGE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

Design Element	Building Feature		Approved	Comments
Location		+	Rear-yard location	
		+	Align with adjacent secondary structures	
		+	Use to define and enclose rear yard	
		+	Minimize paving	
Materials	Walls	+/-	Horizontal wood siding (3" or 4" exposure)	Material and reveal TBD
		NA	Board and batten siding	
		NA	Brick	
		NA	Stucco over frame or concrete block	
		NA	Cast stone, molded concrete block	
		NA	Aluminum and vinyl siding (3" or 4" exposure)	
		NA	No painted concrete block.	
		NA	No un-painted concrete block.	
		NA	No T-111 plywood.	
	Roof	+	Asphalt, fiberglass, wood, vinyl, or slate shingles.	Asphalt shingles
		NA	Metal roofing	
		NSI	Half-round or Ogee gutters	See conditions of approval
Building Forms	Main Block	+	Simple, rectangular, prismatic volumes	
		NA	Ell-shaped buildings	
		NA	Slightly-projecting bays	
		NA	Cantilevered, second floors	
		NA	No overly-elaborate volumes	
	Roof	+	Simple gable roofs (6-in-12 minimum slope)	4:12
		NA	Hipped, shed, and flat roofs with parapets	
		NA	Intersecting gables	
		+	Overhanging eaves	
		NSI	Half-round gutters	See conditions of approval
		NA	No low-pitched gable roofs (less than 6-in-12 slope)	

		NA	No flush eaves	
		NA	No roofs without gutters	
Openings	Garage	-	Single-car openings	Double-car opening
	Doors	+	Surface area of door broken up by articulated panels or stiles and rails to reduce scale	Articulated panels
		-	No double and triple doors	Double door
		NA	No flush garage doors (they accentuate the large size of the openings)	
	Windows	NA	Use window openings to break up wall surface	
		NA	Security grills installed on the inside face of the windows	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines	NA	Not Applicable
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines	NSI	Not Sufficient Information
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted		

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	See conditions of approval
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	NA	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	NA	

ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	