



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Cynthia Elmore, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Bradley Fister, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: November 01, 2021

Case No: 21-COA-0236
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2112 Edgeland Ave.

Applicant: Radhika Nair,
ARN Holdings LLC
11303 Yandell Dr.
Louisville, KY 40223
(502) 299-4005
radhika@kpshealthcare.org

Contractor: Same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: \$5210.90

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a 1'-0" to 2'-0" tall retaining wall with railroad ties to help to terrace the front lawn. As well as approval for a rear drive and parking pad.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application:

The application was received on October 6, 2021. The application was classified as requiring Committee Review. Staff spoke with the applicant by referral from the Cherokee Triangle Neighborhood Association. The application calls for a retaining wall, however it is staff's understanding from speaking to the applicant, that the applicant intends to terrace the front lawn. It was then determined that this application would need a Committee-level review and is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle ARC on Wednesday November 10, 2021 at 4:30pm, online via WebEx.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is included in this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The circa 1905 wood frame brick clad duplex sits 13 lots north of the intersection of Bardstown Rd. and Edgeland Ave. The house is a two-and-one-half-story double front porch with a hipped roof, and hipped roof dormer. The site is zoned R6 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District.

Conclusions

The proposed changes to the property have been found partially not to meet the design guidelines for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District. Staff determined that the proposed retaining wall and terracing is not appropriate for this property at this time. If deemed necessary, a lower curb-style border would be more in keeping with the Design Guidelines. Per the Cherokee Triangle Site Design Guidelines, **ST-8** states to maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present, and **ST-10** which states not to install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists. The applicant was aware a COA is required for all exterior changes and kindly applied prior to construction thanks to information provided to them by the Cherokee Triangle Neighborhood Association.

The proposed rear drive and parking pad generally do meet the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District design guidelines. Staff determined the proposed drive and parking pad is accessible from the rear alley. Staff also found that the applicant shall be required to receive a waiver for accessory use area, as well as a waiver for private yard reduction. These waivers are required even with approval of the project by the committee.

Recommendation

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a retaining wall is **denied**.

Based on the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a rear drive and parking pad be approved with the following conditions.

1. All grade level concrete shall be of historic concrete mix.
2. The applicant shall take care to retain the brick paving and limestone curbing.
3. Applicant shall make provisions to screen trash receptacles.
4. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.
5. All other required permits or approvals for construction shall be obtained prior to construction beginning.

Bradley Fister

11-01-21

Bradley Fister
Historic Preservation Specialist

Date

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	-/+	The retaining wall generally does not meet the design guidelines in height or material.
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any re-platting should be consistent with original development patterns.	+	Property line patterns remain the same.
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	Proposed concrete drive generally is in keeping with neighboring properties.
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	Applicant shall maintain existing limestone curbing and brick alley.
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	NA	
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	Proposed drive and parking are in rear.
ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	-	The topography of the front yard would change.
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+	Applicant shall take precautions when installing drive an parking pad near existing garage.
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	-	The railroad tie retaining wall does not have historic precedent and is not necessary to retain soil. If necessary, a lower curb-style border would be more in keeping with the Design Guidelines.

ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	Use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	NA	
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	NA	
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	NA	
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	NA	
ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	NA	