

Unedited Transcript of Government Oversight/Audit and Appointments
Committee

WEBVTT

1 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:00:36.720 --> 00:00:55.020
Change the.

2 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:01:48.330 --> 00:02:04.620
Okay well? Okay.

3 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:03:10.200 --> 00:03:25.530
Yeah, so.

4 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:06:14.129 --> 00:06:29.879
Okay, she said she did that. Okay.

5 "Kevin Bratcher" (4219162880)
00:07:16.658 --> 00:07:19.247
Are we waiting?

6 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:07:19.247 --> 00:07:31.096
Yes sir, one moment I am gonna give you an update in just a second but we
are meeting, we're just waiting for a second.

7 "Kevin Bratcher" (4219162880)
00:07:31.096 --> 00:07:45.494
Thank you.

8 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:08:43.769 --> 00:09:00.029
Oh, so let me be quiet.

9 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:09:20.029 --> 00:09:54.289
Hello that are virtual, we are waiting for the chair to arrive. She's
running a few minutes late.

10 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:10:12.539 --> 00:10:43.339
Metro TV, 30 s, please.

11 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:11:03.339 --> 00:11:17.699
Good afternoon, Welcome to the regularly scheduled meeting for government
oversight accountability. I'm counselor Woman Pervis.

12 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:11:17.699 --> 00:11:37.699

I am the chair, I'm joining chambers today by councilman Herndon. Councilman Owens. Councilman Piagentini, I am joined virtually by councilman Paula McCraney. Councilman.

13 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:11:37.699 --> 00:12:07.999

Councilman Bretcher, council moment, Jenny Morbreen Rich. We do have a quorum and you want to go ahead and read your disclaimer? This meeting is being held pursuant took care of us 61.826 and council rule five A read and full. Thank you. I am also join back councilman Kramer here in the chambers. 1st thing I'm gonna.

14 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:12:07.999 --> 00:12:25.619

Agenda is, let's see, we are going to start with, say something 1st. So.

15 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:12:25.619 --> 00:12:47.029

What we're going to do is, item number two is going to be held as well as.

16 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:12:47.029 --> 00:13:20.929

Item three has been held pair of the sponsor. Councilman Raid and councilman Piergetini. So we are going to start with the appointments 1st before we go into the discussion and the 1st apartment is the apartment of Danita Chetam to the deputy.

17 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:13:20.929 --> 00:13:47.209

Sheriff Mayork board. Term expires 13 June 2027I need a motional second. Thank you. Miss Jackson. Althia Jackson from Mayork Greenberg's office. So the deputy sheriff, has board has five members, they serve for a three year term. Two are appointed by the mayor with the approval of the council. Two members are appointed by the sheriff.

18 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:13:47.209 --> 00:14:13.279

Office and one is and one member is elected by the two members are appointed by the Jefferson County sheriffs, and then one member is appointed by their FOP. There are, that their purpose is to hold hearings public and exist.

19 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:14:13.279 --> 00:14:33.279

Executive and disciplinary matters concerning the deputy sheriffs, which is consistent with the duties and limitations set forth in ordinance and KRS 70.260. The qualifications, they have to be at least 30 years old and a resident of the county. No person shall serve on the board.

20 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:14:33.279 --> 00:15:00.529

Who is a deputy sheriff, or holds any other elected office. They can't be a part of the immediate family of a, of a sheriff. And so today we are

asking to move forward with Danita Chetam. She is out of Metro Council District 22. She has 30 plus years of HR experience. She has her masters of arts.

21 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:15:00.529 --> 00:15:20.529

In management. She is skilled in strategic planning, organizational strategy, labor law, and employee relations among other things. She supports HR responsibilities for both private and public. She has supported HR responsibility.

22 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:15:20.529 --> 00:15:33.869

For private and public, fortune 500 companies. She is here in chambers to introduce herself to you. Anita, you wanna come forward?

23 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:15:33.869 --> 00:15:49.679

Good evening. As Althia said, my name is Danita Chetam and I appreciate your considering me for the appointment. Are there any questions for me at this time?

24 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:15:49.679 --> 00:16:11.089

Thank you, thank you miss Chetam. Welcome. Just wanted to thank you for your willingness to serve. I did want to point out and I know you're this board generally deals with disciplinary issues and I'm sure you'll you'll handle that in a in a great way. I did want to publicly publicly thank Sheriff James and the sheriff, in the sheriff's office.

25 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:16:11.089 --> 00:16:31.089

We've seen a huge change in how the sheriff has approached in the sheriff's office has approached community policing, particularly around you know thanks to them.

26 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:16:31.089 --> 00:16:51.089

You know, and, and as you're transitioning to help on this board, you know, we appreciate hopefully there's NO major disciplinary issues we gotta deal with, but, but I do want to express my thanks to him and thanks for you for serving on this board. The sheriff's office is an incredibly important role and I'm glad to see the whole office doing more in this community.

27 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:16:51.089 --> 00:16:56.759

Thank you for being a part of that. Thank you.

28 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:16:56.759 --> 00:17:11.909

I don't have any other, comments for speakers, so, if we're ready to vote all those in favor, say I, I, any opposition, the eyes have it. Thank you. Thank you.

29 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:17:11.909 --> 00:17:31.909

The next two we're going to combine the appointment of Yvonne Jones to the human Relations advocacy board term expires 30 September 2029, and the appointment of Ranisha Morton to the human Relations advocacy board term expires 30 September 2026.

30 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:17:31.909 --> 00:17:54.589

Second, please? Thank you, Miss Jackson. So we are asking to move forward with Miss Jones. I'll give you a little background on the human relations advocacy. The purpose of this commission is to promote and secure mutual understanding and respect among everybody. There are member of.

31 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:17:54.589 --> 00:18:24.319

Is to be qualified to be a member of this board. You have to reside in Jefferson County and the members shall include just a variety of social economic, cultural, ethnic, racial groups. So they want this board to be diverse. Miss Jones is at a Metro Council district one. She's an African American female.

32 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:18:24.319 --> 00:18:44.319

She is a former member of the women ambassador program, which is a Metro program. She works on a design team that focuses on creating better human experiences in the workplace. She is a former career coach with Goodwill industries and.

33 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:18:44.319 --> 00:19:04.319

And she is also a former correction officer and youth counselor. She was unable to be here today, so I am presenting on her behalf. Miss, you want me to go on with the 2nd one? Miss Ranisha Martin is out of Metro Council District 25. She is the co owner of.

34 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:19:04.319 --> 00:19:25.909

Martin and Murre counseling and clinical Behavioral health professional. She is a MBA executive with more than ten years experience in behavior, health and community partnerships. She is skilled in program development, strategic planning, public speaking, and leadership. She would.

35 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:19:25.909 --> 00:19:40.769

Be a tremendous asset to this board. We are asking to move forward with her appointment. She is here in chambers to introduce herself as well.

36 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:19:40.769 --> 00:19:58.379

Hello, I'm Ranisha Martin and thank you for your consideration. Any questions? Does anyone have any questions in virtual world?

37 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:19:58.379 --> 00:20:19.999

No, ok. I guess we're ready to vote. All those in favor, say hi. I. Any oppositions? Yes have it for both candidates. Thank you. All right, thank you. Our next apartment is Daniel Corey Schule to the kenttechnianna work.

38 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:20:19.999 --> 00:20:47.509

Works greater level workforce development board Term expires 30 june 2029I need a motional second, please. Thank you, Miss Jackson. So we know that the Kentucky Anna Works Board serves as our local workforce development board. And it serves as that for several counties, Jefferson bullet, Henry Trimble Oldem, Spencer, and Shelby. They provide strategic leadership for workforce development effort.

39 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:20:47.509 --> 00:21:07.509

They provide administrative support for private and public funding sources that can be used to carry out workforce development efforts. These seats are prescribed, and have a representative from community based organizations, private sector economic development, from the state and.

40 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:21:07.509 --> 00:21:27.509

Employment agency, vocational rehab, and adult education. There are 18 members on this board who serve a three year term. We are asking to move forward with Daniel Corey Schul. He is at a Metro Council District 22. He is the senior pastor at Burnout Avenue baptist.

41 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:21:27.509 --> 00:21:47.509

Church. He is the chair, current chair for JCPS school board. He is a lecturer at the Simmons and Campusville universities. He has his PhD as well as masters on and on, and he is very active in this community. I'm sure most of you guys have met.

42 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:21:47.509 --> 00:22:14.659

Him at this point, but he is here to introduce himself to those who haven't met him. Good afternoon. My name is Corey Schul and I am very pleased to be asked by Mayor Greenberg to serve on the Kentucky Anna Works board. I've been working with Kentucky Na works.

43 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:22:14.659 --> 00:22:31.439

On the JCPS side, of course, our academies of Loyal model is really gaining steam. And the partnership between JCPS and Kentuckyana Works has been a monumental one. And so I'm excited to continue work in this capacity.

44 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:22:31.439 --> 00:22:47.759

Thank you so much for lending us your talents and your professionalism and and I'm sure others would agree with me as well. Does anyone have any comments or anything to say? Council Woman Hawkkins?

45 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:22:47.759 --> 00:22:52.816
Else Woman Hawkins. Can you hear me?

46 "Tammy Hawkins" (2127802112)
00:22:52.816 --> 00:23:09.889
Yes. Okay. I just want to say it is a great honor to have pastor Schul serve on this board, definitely I'm supporting this. Hope everybody else do it as well. I think that he brings a great.

47 "Tammy Hawkins" (2127802112)
00:23:09.889 --> 00:23:21.016
Great Wealth of knowledge to this board as well is it? Thank you. Council Woman McCraney.

48 "Paula McCraney" (1712793088)
00:23:21.016 --> 00:23:39.689
Thank you madam chair. Dr., I am so glad to know that you are going to be serving on this board. The Kentucky Anna Works board is the 1st board that I was assigned to when I came to Louisville Kentucky. It is an absolute.

49 "Paula McCraney" (1712793088)
00:23:39.689 --> 00:23:59.917
Wonderful entity that will help so many people in our community that what they do for the youth in this community is actually uncomparable. So thank you for your willingness to serve on this board. You will make a great team member to this board and I thank you for your willingness to serve.

50 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:23:59.917 --> 00:24:00.689
So.

51 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:24:00.689 --> 00:24:20.689
Thank you, thank you without any other comments, we're ready to vote all those in favors say I the oppositions, the eyes have it. Thank you. Our last apartment of the day is dr. Zamanian to the Louisville Convention.

52 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:24:20.689 --> 00:24:28.619
Term expires 16 August 2029I need a motion in 2nd, please.

53 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:24:28.619 --> 00:24:48.619
Thank you miss Jackson. So little tourisms, their mission is to promote, to promote tourism and convention activities in lawful. That's the bottom line. There are ten members, mayor appoints six, the governor appoints three, and then there's one X official on this board and that is the.

54 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:24:48.619 --> 00:25:08.619

Resident and chief executive from the fair board. They serve a three year term. Dr. Kava Zamenia is at a Metro council district eight. He is the founder and CEO of rabbit hole distillery. He has his post doctoral fellowship from Northwestern University.

55 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:25:08.619 --> 00:25:24.089

A Medical school, he has his PHD, Ma BA in clinical psychology. He was unable to be here this evening, but we do want to move forward with his appointment to the tourism, to the Louisal tourism board.

56 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:25:24.089 --> 00:25:44.089

Does anyone have any questions or comments about this apartment? No, all those in favor say I. Any oppositions, the eyes have it. Thank you miss Jackson. Thank you. We will now go back to the top of the agenda with our discussion on housing accountability.

57 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:25:44.849 --> 00:26:04.849

Who do we have here today, good afternoon Jeff Brian Executive Director for economic development with Metro. We have our team from Codes and Regulations and Office of Housing and community development that are happening.

58 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:26:04.849 --> 00:26:24.849

Way to answer any questions regarding our processes involving housing. So we have director Donald Robinson with codes and regulations and his assistant director of Phil Crow, who handles a code enforcement and our housing quality inspections process, and then we have director Laura Govoski with the Office of Housing and Community development. So that'll help.

59 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:26:24.849 --> 00:26:30.119

Happy to answer questions or go into specifics about our processes.

60 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:26:30.119 --> 00:26:48.629

Okay, so an email real simple detail of what I'm looking for in this discussion, but since you're up, what I want to address with you is.

61 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:26:48.629 --> 00:27:08.629

We continue to get calls and complaints from contracted services through the city. And, and I'm looking at one right now, a constituent, and we've gone to her house with you guys before. She is now requesting an internal.

62 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:27:08.629 --> 00:27:16.679

Investigation because she feels her house is in worse condition than it was when the city began the repairs on it.

63 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:27:16.679 --> 00:27:36.679

And so she's going back and forth with this contractor and when things like this happen, these constituents, they don't know who to turn to, but the council office. And so we are trying to answer questions about a contractor that we know nothing about. We don't know their history, we don't know.

64 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:27:36.679 --> 00:27:56.679

Other experience, we don't know if they're insured, we don't know if they're bonded, we don't know anything. So we're poured in the middle of a lot of cases that we don't know anything about, which is why I've always asked you all, who are these contractors that you're using? The ones that you're sending to the houses? What's going on? Who's monitoring their work?

65 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:27:57.719 --> 00:28:17.719

How are you holding them accountable for what they are agreeing to do for the services that they are saying that they're going to provide? Who's cutting the checks? Are you cutting the check before you confirm that the work has been done and done to the satisfaction and what's required in.

66 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:28:17.719 --> 00:28:24.149

That feel, how is this working? Because we are getting two meeting of these calls. I don't know if my.

67 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:28:24.149 --> 00:28:44.149

Colleagues are getting these calls as well, but I know that we're getting these calls and so something's gonna have to be done with these contractors that are being used, that are being used for these services, for these home services because.

68 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:28:44.149 --> 00:29:04.149

It's like I said, we're pulled in the middle and we know nothing about these contractors and to keep getting complaints after complaints after complaints with these homeowners on these contractors, we wanna know what's going on. Are you vetting these contractors? How do you pick these contractors? We wanna know what's going on.

69 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:29:04.149 --> 00:29:11.039

Because we cannot continue to have unhappy constituents when the work is not done accordingly.

70 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:29:11.039 --> 00:29:31.039

So the contractors that we procure and Laura if you wanna, come up and go through the specifics, we do, we do go through contractors, we do better contractors for our, this is regarding our home repair program. So these what what historically we've done is we have a list of contractors that we have on contract with metro. We have our staff.

71 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:29:31.039 --> 00:29:51.039

Would go out and write up the scope of work and inspect the home and come up with an approved scope of work with the homeowner. So we have the homeowner go through the scope of work with our staff and with the contractor and we basically go through a list of our contractors and as, as jobs come up, we go down the list and see who is available and who is qualified.

72 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:29:51.039 --> 00:29:52.439

Slide to do the work.

73 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:29:52.439 --> 00:30:12.439

From that point, we, our, our, our staff does monitor the work with the contractor at the home. There are disputes from time to time. We do have a, we do have a, a constituent relation team in the office of Housing and community development that tries to resolve those.

74 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:30:12.439 --> 00:30:32.439

Those complaints. With in this particular case, you're referring to a councilmen I believe that the I'm yes, I'm not gonna identify the individual, but in this case, I believe we did, we we did have a couple of metro contractors come out and then we went to a 3rd party, not nonprofit, one of our.

75 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:30:32.439 --> 00:30:50.729

Our partners that to help resolve the situation as well just because we, we didn't think we were getting, we were getting any any further traction with that one. That's something we have done in extreme cases throughout the process although I would say those are, those are in the minority of home repair cases that we get.

76 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:30:50.729 --> 00:31:10.729

All that said, it, last year we switched our, the way that we do run the home repair program. We now prefer to use our nonprofit housing partners like New Directions Housing Corporation and Habitat for Humanity to help us do the work because A, we feel like the work can go further than.

77 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:31:10.729 --> 00:31:30.729

Can stretched the metro dollar because we're leveraging other dollars that are out in the community. And number two, we feel like those, those

organizations are able to provide or provide better direct services than our our small team in OHHCD can provide. So that's been the the change in the process. I'll let Laura come up and talk a little bit about.

78 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:31:30.729 --> 00:31:40.739

The specifics and how we bet the contractors and what qualifications those contractors have to have before they go into homes.

79 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:31:40.739 --> 00:32:00.739

Good afternoon Laura Garbalski, Director of the Office of Housing and Community development. Yeah, like Jeff said, we, we do accept applications from contractors throughout the year. It's, it's ongoing. They are, when the contractors apply, they know that they will be working on the homer pay.

80 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:32:00.739 --> 00:32:18.479

Their programs and not everybody, not every contractor is interested in doing that. So these programs are generally funded with you know federal or city dollars, there are limits on them and frankly, they they the contractors are watched very closely. So.

81 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:32:18.479 --> 00:32:38.479

They so anyway, they apply, and our team vets them, we look at whether they're in compliance with the revenue commission where what their references look like, how long they've been in business, the general, I don't know if it's like resumes, but the.

82 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:32:38.479 --> 00:32:45.419

The work that they've done before. Most, well, I won't say that. A lot of our contractors have been.

83 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:32:45.419 --> 00:33:05.419

Have been on our approved list for a while. They have to go through a variety of certifications for lead based paint. And one thing I will note is that we do have a set of policies around how the contractors are supposed to act.

84 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:33:05.419 --> 00:33:07.139

And do work.

85 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:33:07.139 --> 00:33:27.139

We have, it doesn't happen very often, but we have gone through a situation where a contractor, you know, has done something, has not done work very well. We have, you know, like banned them, I guess from the program. We put people, we put some on suspension. This is.

86 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:33:27.139 --> 00:33:46.529

For, you know, the last decade. We really don't, we've done maybe over the past three years, 300 cases and I know our office of client services that handles complaints, they have handled five that I can remember. Like Jeff said, we are.

87 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:33:46.529 --> 00:34:06.529

Moving toward using subrecipients more frequently. Our inspectors, when the contractor is out doing work, they are inspecting the work. So these are not code enforcement inspectors. These are inspectors, housing rehab inspectors. They are the ones that are looking at the scope.

88 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:34:06.529 --> 00:34:12.719

We're writing that up with the homeowner and making sure that the contractor is, is.

89 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:34:12.719 --> 00:34:32.719

Fulfilling the scope. I think most of the, most of the complaints that, that we get that are fairly easily resolved have to do with a discrepancy between what the homeowner thought was going to happen and what actually did happen. So we've worked on increasing and improving our communication.

90 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:34:33.929 --> 00:34:53.929

To your point, sometimes we do have contractors that, that don't live up to the, the work that we would, we would like to, we would like to see and that we want the homeowners to see. In those cases, in every case, the, the house goes through a final inspection through our office before.

91 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:34:53.929 --> 00:35:04.859

The contractor gets paid. Often there might be a couple of things left to do, so the contractor will be made to do those before they are paid.

92 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:35:04.859 --> 00:35:24.859

In the, what I would consider worst case scenario, if we have an inspector, a human inspector who has inspected a work that a contractor has done, and that is not good enough, that sometimes is when those complaints get, they come in through client services and we.

93 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:35:24.859 --> 00:35:44.859

We do what we can to make them, to make them right. So how many complaints average amount of complaints that you receive in regards to the contractor's work? Yeah, I took a look at that after seeing the email and over the past three years.

94 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:35:44.859 --> 00:36:04.859

Which is when we've really had the office of client services. It's been about five. Now that, that means the work is done, the homeowner is within their warranty period and the, and they have contacted the contractor and something has broken down. So that is not to say that.

95 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:36:04.859 --> 00:36:15.749

During the process, you know, there has been, a homeowner could have a complaint, it's resolved, we move on. But these are actually complaints where the homeowner is.

96 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:36:15.749 --> 00:36:35.749

Finished with the work. The contractor's finished with the work, the the contractor has been paid and the the warranty has been placed and those complaints have come in. So five with it over about three years. So I'd like to know that the constituent that is wanting to follow a complaint or wanting investigations.

97 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:36:35.749 --> 00:36:44.879

Stating their house is worse off than it was before. I assume you have the scope of work for everyone.

98 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:36:44.879 --> 00:36:59.969

And so, how are you gonna move forward? Well, I know we don't want to talk about the specifics of that. Absolutely not. Right.

99 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:36:59.969 --> 00:37:17.519

In a, in a situation where metro or OHCB had used a contractor to do that work at the at at the point of time when we cannot come to an agreement.

100 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:37:17.519 --> 00:37:36.959

We do, we've only, I think done it twice that I know about. We would refer that person over to risk management to metro's risk management. In this particular situation, to Jeff's point, there was a 3rd party a subrecipient involved, so that makes it a little bit more complicated, but that is.

101 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:37:36.959 --> 00:37:56.959

Risk management sometimes can, can come in and help to make the homeowner whole if it really does seem like the contractor did something wrong and our office didn't catch it, which I mean, you know, we are human every once in a while there is an error, so the.

102 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:37:56.959 --> 00:38:15.990

That that's our, I don't want to say like the last, the last chance, but we try to, we try to do everything we can to resolve the situation, but

sometimes we just can't resolve it. So that is, so sometimes we have to refer to risk management. Like I said in this particular case.

103 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:38:15.990 --> 00:38:31.350

We're trying to work with the, the sub recipient to figure out what work is it is that issue right now. Was it, you know, the original scope, was it the subrecipient scope? It's gotten a bit complicated.

104 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:38:31.350 --> 00:38:51.350

Thank you. Kind of a different direction. Just want to confirm something I think we've been working, we've been talking about for a little bit of time, and that is the procedure to enter property, particularly related to landlords, right, when codes and regs are doing their process to inspect or, you know, serve notice and all.

105 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:38:51.350 --> 00:38:57.960

Of this stuff. We I did receive and I think we've communicated on this, but I just wanna talk about it here for just for a minute.

106 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:38:57.960 --> 00:39:15.300

Concerns that all of our codes and regs officers, and we have a procedure that follows due process, constitutional due process rights, where, you know, we just can't walk onto private property randomly without.

107 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:39:15.300 --> 00:39:35.300

You know certain things to be true and or proper notice and all of this. Can we just talk a little bit about the procedure that we're following and ensuring that it is following ostitutional president? Okay, Donald Robinson coaching regulations director. So I'll just go through just a regular case. We get a, we get a complaint with a property.

108 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:39:35.300 --> 00:39:53.040

We send a code enforcement officer out to investigate what we what we do is try to make contact with that particular person at the, at that residence. And if we're able to make contact, we will go over all of the, just all of the things that are.

109 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:39:53.040 --> 00:40:08.400

Incorrect with the property. So, the 1st defense we'll do is a viol violation notice and we'll say we're putting you on notice, we're given you ten days to correct these particular problems and we'll come back and do a reinspect.

110 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:40:08.400 --> 00:40:25.920

So that's, that's one, one part of just making contact. Now, if we have a residence where we go to, we ring a doorbill, we try to gain access. We

don't have access to that particular property. Then what we do is we post the particular notice on the front of the house.

111 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:40:25.920 --> 00:40:45.920

And in some cases there's always a violation in the backyard or if there's a neighbor or neighbor complaint, we would try to gain access to that property through the neighbors residents. We can look, you know, look into the backyard, but we cannot physically go and open a gate and, and inspect that particular property.

112 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:40:48.150 --> 00:41:08.150

Property is owned by the person who resides there. Correct. So it's tenant, right? Yes. If it's quite clear to me that if they you knock on the door person that answers the door is the property owner you're making contact with the owner of the residents, NO problem.

113 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:41:08.150 --> 00:41:28.150

To your point, you can do plain view from the If you don't make contact with anybody, you can do plain view. Absolutely. You can't, now as I understand it, you can certainly walk to the front door, but you can't just then I can't yeah so falling off, I can say.

114 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:41:28.150 --> 00:41:33.630

Absolutely.

115 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:41:33.630 --> 00:41:53.630

Okay. How does that work? Well, if they're under lease, they can tell us or they can say come on in that's. But anything that we find on that particular property is gonna be sited against the owner of that property. So.

116 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:41:53.630 --> 00:42:02.280

Absolutely.

117 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:42:02.280 --> 00:42:20.100

I think that's all the scenarios. Oh yeah, and then when you don't make contact, and let's just say the, the claim, let's say it's a tenant claim, right? And the issue is interior to the property, right?

118 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:42:20.100 --> 00:42:40.100

You come up to the door. What next? So we will put that on the list to return to that particular property and we will keep returning until we gain, you know, someone. Absolutely.

119 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:42:40.100 --> 00:43:00.100

It's a lot of runs ok great thank you very much. So I think some of the changes and procedures that you guys are doing seem to be working, but I'll let you know if I.

120 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:43:00.100 --> 00:43:15.360

And, you know, we are a government agency, we need to give proper notice and go through the proper process before we properties. Absolutely. Thank you. Thank you.

121 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:43:15.360 --> 00:43:35.360

Thank you. Thanks for being here guys. Just a couple of things I've seen that process happen in real time with golds and you know, I wanna say mr. Robinson that, you know, since you've been.

122 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:43:35.360 --> 00:43:55.360

In this role that, you know, you and mr. Crow, I wanna say that anytime that any of my constituents have had the smallest to the biggest issues you all have came out yourself, you know, and investigated it. And that means a lot, even.

123 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:43:55.360 --> 00:44:15.360

Even if your employees had came out, you know, cited someone once I've given you guys a call, you know, if you guys didn't think that it warranted or was something that they missed, you guys looked at it with a second set of lenses. And that right there speaks value. So I really do see that change and I want.

124 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:44:15.360 --> 00:44:25.440

Thank you for that. Thank you.

125 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:44:25.440 --> 00:44:45.440

So this is like twofolds. I didn't know where this was going cause I didn't, you know, I didn't know what this conversation was gonna be about today, but, the contractors, right? The contractors that, you know, I know my colleague or councilwoman Pervis was saying that I guess someone or a constituent.

126 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:44:45.440 --> 00:44:56.790

One constituent has some issues or concerns about the process for construction, right? Contracts and things like that.

127 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:44:56.790 --> 00:45:16.790

Metro government, pretty much outsources Metro government is not the contractor, correct? Is, is that I think that you didn't make that clear. Metro government is not the contractor for any properties when when that are renovated. Metro government outsources.

128 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:45:17.760 --> 00:45:37.760

Right with new directions, habitat for humanity, things like that. At the same time, these contractors have to go through certain processes to be able to become a vendor or a contractor for housing, correct? Right, that's correct. Right, so we just outsour.

129 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:45:37.760 --> 00:45:45.480

I want to make that very clear that metro government does not go out and do work on.

130 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:45:45.480 --> 00:46:05.480

That's, that's that's correct. Can I just clarify one thing council? I'm sorry to interrupt. The metro government, we, we have historically directly contracted with private businesses that are in the contracting field. They have to go through a process of certification and training with our team. What we are.

131 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:46:05.480 --> 00:46:20.970

Moving toward is going to sub recipients where that's a technical term that we use on our federal funds to our nonprofit partners who may also use their in house staff or may also have contractors that also have to go through those same certifications because.

132 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:46:20.970 --> 00:46:40.970

Overwhelmingly, our home repair program in led payment removal programs are federally funded programs, so these funds require that they have the proper certifications in order to administer federal funds and remediate items that are federally leg regulated like lead based payments.

133 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:46:40.970 --> 00:47:00.970

So those are the sorts of things that we have to go through that hud re the housing and urban development with the federal government requires us to have those certifications, so that's I just want to make that clarification. We are moving more toward the sub recipient model because we found that to be more efficient and more effective in our service delivery.

134 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:47:00.970 --> 00:47:19.800

The in the event of of the process doesn't change. It doesn't matter if it is with new directions, if it's have a debt for humanity, in the event that if a constituent is not happy with any contractor.

135 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:47:19.800 --> 00:47:39.800

That metro government sends for that or they bid, right? Cause I know sometimes they bid up, you know, different, projects. If for some

apparent reason the constituent is not happy with that work, then does Metro government step in?

136 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:47:39.800 --> 00:47:42.300
And, you know, and, and.

137 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:47:42.300 --> 00:48:02.300
Start to investigate what is the process in the event if a constituent is not happy with the work of a contractor that has been subcontracted through one of our vendors procurement process. Just what does that look like?

138 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:48:02.300 --> 00:48:22.300
So the people that are listening can understand what it would look like in the event if they're not happy, does it come back to you all? Does it just say, does it land on the contractor because they've already went through everything, you know, because remember, we're not the contractor.

139 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:48:22.300 --> 00:48:42.710
Right. Yeah, so our our So usually the way that happens is if there is a concern with the work, the homeowner will usually contract the inspector or project manager, that is, that is overseeing the work. So we always have a metro staff person, in the case where we are finding the contract, that metro staff person is over.

140 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:48:42.710 --> 00:49:02.710
Seeing the work. They're, they're helping the contractor writing up the scope, they're going through that scope with the homeowner. So usually that those case manager inspector, so they will come through and our staff will go and inspect the work. They'll have a conversation with the contractor, they'll see if the work was done properly in scope.

141 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:49:02.710 --> 00:49:22.710
Up or not, and then we'll try to resolve it kind of on a, kind of at that level. If things get elevated, we have, of course, work government agency so we have a bureaucracy, we'll kind of elevate to supervisors and managers from there in the rare instance, we will take the contract, the contractor that was working on the project.

142 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:49:22.710 --> 00:49:26.910
Off and shifted to another one of our contractors.

143 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)
00:49:26.910 --> 00:49:46.910
So that is, again, I think miss Grovaski said that we have, how many, we did 300 over the last three years, we do about a hundred home repair cases a year, so we've had five, five complaints for the last three

years, so it's extremely rare that we have to make those moves, but we will move to other contractors or look at other partners to try to effectively resolve the situation.

144 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:49:46.910 --> 00:49:53.970

So that we're not getting complaints into our council offices or into, into Laura's office or my office.

145 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:49:53.970 --> 00:50:13.970

I just wanted to add one thing. Councilmen to your question, when the cases are primarily handled by our sub recipients, they have their own complaint policies, so we ask them to attempt to resolve it, but yes, I mean, we are.

146 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:50:15.000 --> 00:50:35.000

We're, we're the ultimate contractor for their services, so, should habitat or new directions receive a complaint and not be able to, to resolve the complaint then yeah it comes into our office. We we were still, we're only about a year into this and we have not really seen that yet.

147 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:50:35.000 --> 00:50:38.610

And it seems like the sub recipients like our office.

148 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:50:38.610 --> 00:50:55.380

You know, they have a lot of tools at their disposal to, to try to make everything, to resolve any issues that, that the, that the constituent might have. But that's how that would happen. So if you are, you know, you're a homeowner and you're receiving repairs.

149 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:50:55.380 --> 00:51:15.380

From habitat or new directions, we would say start with that group. They're gonna have, they're gonna have some tools at their disposal to try to resolve, if not, then, then you contact us. But case investigator with every case that follows that case.

150 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:51:15.380 --> 00:51:35.380

Kinda all the way through. So in the event, if there's some hiccups or if it's something that they're not liking, they would be able to kinda see it and identify it right then and there. We do. We do if, when we are running the program. In the subrecipients case because of the just the separation we have.

151 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:51:35.380 --> 00:51:53.220

We have a monitoring team that does spot checks and, you know, does income checks and will handle any of the complaints that come in. So there's a a larger caseload, but yes. Okay. Thank you.

152 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:51:53.220 --> 00:52:13.220

Laura or Jeff can answer this question. Do you all do before pictures when you create the scope of work for the area to be worked on of the homes? Yes, we do. Our inspectors take before pictures and after pictures. Those have been very helpful.

153 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:52:13.220 --> 00:52:33.220

In in the complaint cases and also in the not complaint cases because a lot of times it, you know, you really do see quite a quite a visible impact. But yes, as far as complaints go, those have been very helpful to be able to look in the in the the software that we use in the case file and see, you know, what, what the inspector.

154 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:52:33.220 --> 00:52:39.510

Or what the homeowner saw as the, as the before what they saw the problem as.

155 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:52:39.510 --> 00:52:59.510

I think you guys I will speak with you all later about the case that wants an investigation. So I I would like to move on to code enforcement and I understand that you guys are gonna actually speak for little mental housing Authority and.

156 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:53:00.810 --> 00:53:20.810

In the email that I sent you all, I was and I'll read it. I like to know the number of housing deficiencies regarding section eight rentals, and are the landlords being made aware of these deficiencies and are they able to remain in the program?

157 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:53:20.810 --> 00:53:31.410

With being a negligent land landlord and who oversees inspections prior to these properties being occupied?

158 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:53:31.410 --> 00:53:51.410

Okay, I'll attempt to speak to lmha's piece. Well, i'll speak to code enforcement. I'll give you the numbers from 1 January through 31 July of 26. We attempted 4140 inspections and out of the 4000 01:40, we have.

159 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:53:51.410 --> 00:54:08.610

Had a hundred, I mean 1000 06:38 that failed inspection. We had 2031 that passed. Yes. Well, it's the Okay. Yes, and again we we performed the inspection, so.

160 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:54:08.610 --> 00:54:28.610

What we do is we send out our, we get the notice from LMHA LMHA, we send out that inspector to inspect according to the inspire system, which is a different system that's used by LMHA has different aspects of what we're looking for inside of the houses.

161 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:54:28.610 --> 00:54:35.670

And we perform those particular duties and that's why, you know, you have, you have.

162 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:54:35.670 --> 00:54:55.670

You know, the, the 2000 that are passed, but the the 1600 has failed, the majority of the failures, it's kind of, the old ordinance, we, we required one smoke detector that will sound in the, in the dwelling and the new inspire system.

163 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:54:55.670 --> 00:55:02.250

Requires one smoke detector in every room, so a lot of the homeowners or the owners.

164 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:55:02.250 --> 00:55:22.250

Does not understand that particular change, in the law, so we have a lot of failures with, with that particular section of the inspection. So it's a it's a faster turnaround when, when those owners, they they realize that all I have to do is is you know buy a smoke detector and we'll, we'll bring that produ.

165 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:55:22.250 --> 00:55:30.750

Particular property of the code, so. Have you all provided these landlords with an update on what's required?

166 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:55:30.750 --> 00:55:48.330

That that will be LMHA. Okay. Yes. Okay. So if they do not become compliant, what happens? Are they able to stay in the program as far as renting their properties out through section eight?

167 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:55:48.330 --> 00:56:08.330

Well, from our end, if there's life safety, things that are being, being caught in those inspections, we give them 48 h to correct those particular deficiencies. Any minor item that's called in the inspection, it's a 30 day turnaround, so.

168 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:56:08.330 --> 00:56:18.690

So after those particular time frames are exhausted, then we turn that particular case back over to LMHA and then they will make the decision from there.

169 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:56:18.690 --> 00:56:36.450

So, I also wanted to know the number of deficiencies on rental properties and the notice process and you just said the timeframe given to become compliant is 30 days.

170 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:56:36.450 --> 00:56:51.660

Right? Yes. So do you all contact the the property owner, email mail? It's an email that goes out immediately.

171 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:56:51.660 --> 00:57:07.470

And so if you do not get a response, how do you move forward? A respond well, this is just normal. When you.

172 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:57:07.470 --> 00:57:27.470

Go out and cite someone for a violation and you do not get a response. How do you move forward? Well, we we look at the timeframe, if we cite them, then we will continue to come out and follow up on those particular inspections and.

173 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:57:27.470 --> 00:57:32.970

Each time we come out, then we're gonna put another citation on that particular case.

174 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:57:32.970 --> 00:57:48.600

Penalty could be a lean. Do you know how many deficiencies on average that you you have on rental properties?

175 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:57:48.600 --> 00:58:04.950

I don't have that, that number right with me, but I can get it for you. Okay, I'm just curious. Okay, ok. Does anyone have any questions besides me? Okay.

176 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:58:04.950 --> 00:58:24.950

I think that's it. Thank you all for being here. Thank you. That's it. Thank you. Thank you.

177 "Harward, Sonya" (1113762304)

00:58:24.950 --> 00:58:26.880

This meeting is now adjourned.