



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report of the Committee

DENIAL

To: Louisville Collegiate School
Thru: Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee
From: Bradley Fister, Planning & Design Coordinator
Date: March 8, 2023

Case No: 22-COA-0251
Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2354, 2356, 2358 Grinstead Dr.
2421, 2423 Glenmary Ave.

Owner: LCS Yorktown, LLC
710 Barrett Ave. Suite 201
Louisville, KY 40204

Applicant: Louisville Collegiate School
2427 Glenmary Ave.
Louisville, KY 40204

Representative: Nick Pregliasco
Bardenwerper, Talbott and Roberts PLLC
1000 N Hurstbourne Parkway, second floor
Louisville, KY 40223
nrp@bardlaw.net

Plan Prepared by: John Carman
CARMAN Landscape Architecture, Urban Planning, & Civil
Engineering
400 E. Main Street Unit 106
Louisville, KY 40202
859-254-9803
jcarman@carmansite.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant proposes to demolish three, two-story, approximately 10,600 sq. ft, circa 1960 apartment buildings, each with 16 one-bedroom units, to create a 56-vehicle parking lot. The proposed parking lot is to provide off street parking for the Louisville Collegiate School, and would be accessible from the existing ingress/egress to the apartment complex along Grinstead Dr.

This parking lot is part of a larger, conceptual plan to relieve traffic strain on Glenmary Ave. While the plan is still conceptual at this time, it shows a new driveway off Glenmary Ave. that flows traffic to the proposed new parking lot with access to Grinstead Dr.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on October 7, 2022, and it was determined on October 10, 2022 that the application would require committee review. Staff had the application reviewed by both Planning & Design's Transportation Team as well as the Board of Zoning Adjustment Team. It was determined on November 8, 2022 that the application did meet all LDC requirements. The case is scheduled to be heard by the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on November 30, 2022 at 4:30 pm, in-person at 444 S. 5th Street, Room 101.

On November 30, 2022, the Cherokee Triangle ARC met at 4:30 pm in room 101 of 444 S. 5th Street to discuss case 22-COA-0251. Members present were Committee Chair Gail Morris, Pete Kirven, Jennifer Schultz, David Morgan, and Robert Kirchdorfer. Joe Haberman and Savannah Darr, Landmarks Staff; Nick Pregliasco, Bardenwerper, Talbott & Roberts; John Carman, CARMAN Landscape Architecture, Urban Planning, & Civil Engineering; Robert Macrae, Louisville Collegiate School, were also present.

Ms. Darr presented the staff report, which recommended approval of the project. Mr. Pregliasco and Mr. Carman, representing the applicant, spoke to the proposal to demolish the three apartment buildings and how in doing so it would help alleviate parking, and traffic congestion for the district as a whole. Ms. Morris opened the hearing for committee questions for the applicant and staff. The committee asked questions that were pertinent to the case, including the probable age of the existing buildings, its location, and if the proposed design for a parking lot meets the applicable design guidelines.

Ms. Morris then opened the meeting to public comment. Mr. Fister sent a PDF document to the applicants as well as the committee to review prior to the meeting that contained more than 50 written public comments. Of those in attendance 5 spoke in favor of the project: Megan Metcalf, LA Council Woman Armstrong statement, William Kulp (2542 Ransdell Ave.), Mark Naylor (1436 Cherokee Rd.), Larry Williams (2513 Glenmary Ave.), Bryan Cook (Former Collegiate Board Chair). The discussion primarily focused on Louisville Collegiate School as an asset to the community and its current needs. Of those in attendance 13 spoke in opposition to the project: Deidre Seim (937 Cherokee Road), Erica Summer (2315 Glenmary Ave. Apt. C2), Chris Nunn (1023 Everett Ave. Apt. 9), Evan Bradley (2354 Grinstead Dr.), Jen Zonio (223 Mt. Holly Ave.), Carson Adams (no comment just signed in), Marren Lane (2418 Glenmary Ave.), Shawn Reilly (1703 Tyler Parkway), Johnny Mitchell (2354 Grinstead Dr. #10), Alex Karl (2418 Glenmary Ave.), Mary Alexander (2526 Glenmary Ave.), Mariel Gardner (3714 Southern Ave.), Mary Kay Flagey (2332 Glenmary Ave.). The discussion primarily revolved around if the buildings were considered contributing or not, if a parking lot is approvable by the ARC, traffic concerns, loss of housing, and the need for affordable housing in the community as a whole.

With no further comment, Ms. Morris closed the public testimony. The ARC members deliberated the proposal and were left with questions for Landmarks staff and the applicant. Thus, Ms. Morris made a motion to defer the case for further information from staff. Mr. Kirven seconded the motion. The motion to defer passed unanimously (5 yes and 0 no). The ARC members requested more information on how the block on which Collegiate School is located has changed over time. They also requested a better context for the Yorktown Apartments to determine their contributing or noncontributing status.

The continued ARC meeting was scheduled for Wednesday, January 25th, in the Old Jail Auditorium. Due to a noticing error, and out of an abundance of caution, the meeting was postponed to February 8th. However, due to unexpected life events, quorum was lost, and the meeting was rescheduled to Wednesday, March 8, 2023, in the Old Jail Auditorium (514 W. Jefferson St.) at 5:30pm.

The Cherokee Triangle ARC met on March 8, 2023 at 5:30 pm in the auditorium of the Old Jail located at 514 W. Jefferson St. Committee members in attendance were Committee Chair Gail Morris, Robert Kirchdorfer, Pete Kirven, Jen Schultz, and Ashlyn Ackerman. Joe Haberman, Savannah Darr, Priscilla Bowman, and Brad Fister, Landmarks Staff; Nick Pregliasco, Bardenwerper, Talbott & Roberts; and John Carman, CARMAN Landscape Architecture, Urban Planning, & Civil Engineering, were also present.

After Chair Morris called the meeting to order, Metro Council President Markus Winkler read a statement prepared by Kentucky State Senator Cassie Chambers Armstrong who was the former Metro Council Representative for District 8 in which the property is located. Then Mr. Fister presented read an introduction explaining the delay of the meeting; a memorandum explaining the research done by Landmarks Staff; and then the staff report, which recommended approval of the project with ten conditions of approval. Mr. Pregliasco, representing the applicant, spoke to the proposal to demolish the three apartment buildings and how in doing so it would help alleviate parking, and traffic congestion for the district as a whole. Mr. Carman, representing the applicant, spoke to the buildings being proposed for demolition are not contributing based on the research by staff, and the criteria set forth by the National Parks Service. Mr. Carman explained how the proposed design will maintain the street wall by using landscaping. He also explained the proposed demolition with help to alleviate the traffic and parking concerns of the school and the neighboring streets. He also explained that the conceptual proposal is only adding a few more parking spaces on the lot than what already exist.

Ms. Morris opened the hearing for committee questions for the applicant and staff. The committee asked questions that were pertinent to the case, including the probable age of the existing buildings, its location, and if the proposed design for a parking lot meets the applicable design guidelines.

Ms. Morris then opened the meeting to public comment. Mr. Fister sent a PDF document to the applicants as well as the committee to review prior to the meeting that contained more than 75 written public comments. Of those in attendance 3 spoke in favor of the project: Waller (Willow Ave. Cherokee Triangle Trustee), Karen Morrison (Gilda's Club CEO), McCauley Adams (1287 Everett Ave.). The discussion primarily focused on Louisville Collegiate School as an asset to the community and its current needs. Of those in attendance 2 spoke neutrally of the project: Monica Orr (2419 Longest Ave.), Charles Cash (500 Upland Rd.). The discussion primarily

focused on the impact of the proposed new design in terms of trees, landscaping, and best use of future space. Of those in attendance 17 spoke in opposition to the project: Steve Porter (2406 Tucker Station Road), Mimi Feeder (Glenmary Ave.), Merrin Lane (2418 Glenmary Ave.), Deidre Seim (937 Cherokee Rd.), Peter Globber (2506 Glenmary Ave.), Mary Kay Flagg (2322 Glenmary Ave.), Katherine McGuinne (Coalition for Homeless), Andrew Gentile (2408 Glenmary Ave.), Rachel Phillips (2428 Ransdell Ave.), Ted Shouse (2432 Ransdell Ave.), Becky Gorman (927 Texas Ave.), Jody Dahmer (Finzer Ave.), Emily Skinner (164 Pennsylvania Ave.), Sarah Fisher (432 E. Lee Street), Evan Bradley (2354 Grinstead Dr.), Steve Seim (937 Cherokee Rd.), Patrick McCarthy (2354 Grinstead Dr.). The discussion primarily revolved around if the buildings were considered contributing or not, if a parking lot is approvable by the ARC, traffic concerns, loss of housing, and the need for affordable housing in the community as a whole. Mr. Porter submitted photos to the ARC as evidence of his argument for the buildings' contributing status. Those were added to the case file.

With no further comment, Ms. Morris closed the public testimony. The Committee asked further questions of the applicant and staff regarding the proposed project. There was discussion about the proposed buildings being contributing or not and the use of the land for a parking lot.

Mr. Kirven made a motion to approve the application. Mr. Kirchdorfer seconded the motion. The motion to approve failed with 2 yes votes (Kirven and Kirchdorfer) and 3 no votes (Schultz, Morris, and Ackerman).

Ms. Schultz made a motion to deny the application. Ms. Ackerman asked to make a friendly amendment to that motion and added that the committee finds the proposal does not meet Demolition Guideline 1 "the demolition will not adversely affect the district's (or the landmark's) distinctive characteristics, taken as a whole, retained over time" or DE6 and that the buildings are contributing because they meet 5 of the 6 design elements typified in the Colonial Revival architectural style. Ms. Schultz accepted the amendment. Ms. Ackerman seconded the motion. The motion to deny the application passed with 3 yes votes (Schultz, Morris, and Ackerman) and 2 no votes (Kirven and Kirchdorfer). The meeting adjourned at approximately 8:30pm.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design guidelines, approved for the Cherokee Triangle Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **Demolition** and **Site**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The R7 zoned property within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District, is located on the east side of Grinstead Dr., three lots north of Grinstead Ct. The three circa 1960, two-story, brick clad apartment buildings provide a total of 48 one-bedroom apartments. The Colonial Revival Style apartments have shingled hipped roofs, coined corners, segmental brick arched windows, brick sills, concrete patios for the first-level units, and wooden balconies for the second-level units.

DECISION

On the basis of the information furnished by staff and the applicant, the Cherokee Triangle Architectural Review Committee finds that the Yorktown Apartment buildings located at 2354, 2356, and 2358 Grinstead Dr. are considered contributing to the district. Thus, the proposal does not meet Demolition Guideline 1 or DE6 of the Demolition Guidelines. The request for a Certificate of Appropriateness is **denied**.