

Roofing Design Guidelines Analysis

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
R1 Use only replacement materials that closely match the original roofing material in color, texture, and profile. Possible substitute materials include asphalt shingles, dimensional shingles, or cement tiles.	R.4 Use a replacement material that matches the color, texture, and character of the original roof material, and that has a similar proportion of seams and trim to the original roof material. • When replacing a historic metal roof is necessary, use in-kind materials such as copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal. Copper roofs should be left unpainted. Terne-metal roofs should be painted muted red or muted green. • When replacing non-repairable roofing, remove underlying layers to prolong the life of the roof and retain the original profile of the roof edge. • Retain the ridge and hip tiles on a historic tile roof. Replace field tiles with a dimensional shingle of a similar color to the original. • Reinstall ridge and hip tiles to maintain the historic roof profile. • When necessary, replace a historic roof detail, such as decorative cresting and finials, with an in-kind material.	Staff recommends the following edits: R.4 Use a replacement material that matches the color, texture, and character of the original <u>or historic</u> roof material, and that has a similar proportion of seams and trim to the original <u>or historic</u> roof material. • When replacing a historic metal roof is necessary, use in-kind materials such as copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal. Copper roofs should be left unpainted. Terne-metal roofs should be painted muted red or muted green. • When replacing non-repairable roofing, remove underlying layers to prolong the life of the roof and retain the original profile of the roof edge. • Retain the ridge and hip tiles on a historic tile roof. Replace field tiles with a dimensional shingle of a similar color to the original. • Reinstall ridge and hip tiles to maintain the historic roof profile. • When necessary, replace a historic roof detail, such as decorative cresting and finials, with an in-kind material.
R2 Use copper, lead-coated copper, terne-coated stainless steel, or terne metal when replacing a historic metal roof with in-kind materials. While copper roofs may be left unpainted, terne-metal roofs should be painted either muted red or green, traditional roof colors. Replacement with in-kind materials is	** Incorporated into R.4**	

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
recommended in order to preserve the visual appearance of the original.		
R3 Make sure that the proportion of the seams and trim on replacement metal roofing matches that of the original. Commercial-grade architectural metal roofing systems should not be used on residential architecture, because the scale is inappropriate.	** Incorporated into R.4**	
R4 Retain ridge and hip tiles on historic tile roofs. Field tiles may be replaced with a compatible substitute material, such as a dimensional shingle in a color approximating the original. Ridge and hip tiles, however, should be reinstalled to maintain the roof's historic profile. Reinstallation of sound roof tiles and slates on smaller, secondary roof forms (porches, bay windows, etc.) is encouraged wherever possible.	** Incorporated into R.4**	
R5 Remove existing roofing material when replacing non-repairable or non-historic roofing. Removing these underlying layers will prolong the life of the roof and help restore the original profile of the roof edge.	** Incorporated into R.4**	
R6 Do not apply asphalt shingles over wood shingles. This will trap moisture and cause deterioration of the roof structure.	R.5 Do not cover the original roof.	Staff recommends the following edits: R.5 Do not cover the original <u>or historic</u> roof.
R7 Base the reconstruction of any missing roof feature on historical, pictorial, and physical evidence. If such evidence is insufficient, the feature should be of a compatible new design rather than a falsely-historical or conjectural reconstruction.	R.8 If reconstruction of a roof component is necessary, use historical, pictorial, and physical evidence to create an appropriate replica.	
R8 New roof designs for additions or new construction should be compatible in size, scale, material, and color with the historic building and district.	**Not incorporated**	

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
R9 Use the form and detailing of severely deteriorated roof features, such as cupolas and dormers, or chimneys, to create appropriate replicas.	** Incorporated into R.8**	
R10 Avoid having extensive areas of flashing visible. In some cases, portions of metal flashing may be covered by mortar or stucco.	R.13 Avoid the extensive use of visible flashing. If it is necessary, it may be covered with mortar or stucco.	
R11 Do not destroy historic detail when installing replacement gutters. If synthetic materials are used, they should be painted to match the trim color.	R.9 Install a gutter or downspout that is simple in design and that does not damage historic detail of the original structure. • Use a half-round or ogee profile gutter that does not alter the character of the historic trim and that is painted to match the color of the trim. • Do not use unpainted galvanized steel or vinyl gutters or downspouts.	
R12 Half-round replacement gutters that are of a simple design and do not alter the character of the trim, or in limited cases ogee profile gutters, are preferred. Synthetic materials painted to match the trim color are acceptable.	** Incorporated into R.9**	
R13 Do not use unpainted galvanized steel gutters or downspouts, which rust and stain adjacent materials. These gutters should be painted after a period of weathering. Vinyl gutters and downspouts should be avoided due to their short life expectancy.	** Incorporated into R.9**	
R14 Leave historically-exposed rafter ends and eaves open and uncovered.	R.2 Preserve the original eave depth of a roof, leaving eaves and rafter ends open and uncovered.	
R15 Make sure that any new roof-top additions do not compromise the structural integrity of the building.	R.16 Locate energy-generating technology on a historic roof in a way that minimizes impacts to the historic character of the site and structure. • Locate technology where it will not damage, obscure, or cause removal of significant features or materials.	

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
	• Maintain the ability to interpret the historic character of the building. • Install integrated photovoltaic systems so they will not hinder the ability to interpret the historic significance of the structure. • Install solar collectors on an addition or secondary structure, or back from the front facade on a main structure. • Size solar collector arrays to remain subordinate to the historic structure. • Mount solar collectors flush below the ridge line on a sloping roof. • Ensure that exposed hardware, frames and piping have a matte finish, and are consistent with the color scheme of the primary structure.	
R16 Install any new roof-top mechanical or service equipment in such a way that historic fabric is not damaged.	** Incorporated into R.16**	
R17 Do not attach antennae, satellite transmitters, skylights, vents, air conditioning units, decks, terraces, dormers, or solar panels that can be seen from a building's primary elevation. Skylights should be flush (not the "bubble" type) with curbs painted to match the color of the roof material. Consolidate antennae wherever possible.	R.10 Install a skylight that is flush with the roof plane and painted to match the color of the roof material. • Do not use a "bubble" skylight. • Do not install a skylight in a location that is visible from the street.	
R18 Do not introduce mechanical equipment or systems that may overload and compromise a historic building's existing structural system.	** Incorporated into R.16**	
R19 Paint all roof vent assemblies to match the color of the roofing material.	R.12 Paint a roof vent assembly to match the color of the roofing material. • Install a roof vent in a place that is not visible from the public right of way.	

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
R20 Do not install ridge vents on historic structures. They are non-historic approaches to attic ventilation.	R.15 Do not install a ridge vent on a historic structure.	Do we really need this as a guideline?
R21 Replace historic roof details, such as decorative cresting and finials and metal ridge caps on slate roofs with in-kind materials or materials that are visually compatible.	** Incorporated into R.8**	
Not Incorporated Previously	R.1 Preserve the original roof form of a historic structure. • Preserve the angle of a historic roof.	
Not Incorporated Previously	R.3 Repair and maintain the original roof material wherever possible.	Staff recommends the following edits: R.3 Repair and maintain the original <u>or historic</u> roof material wherever possible.
Not Incorporated Previously	R.6 Do not remove an original roof component.	Staff recommends deleting as this is vague and R.7 seems to cover it better.
Not Incorporated Previously	R.7 Preserve an original roof component such as a cupola, dormer, or chimney. • Preserve decorative elements associated with a roof including crests and chimneys.	Staff recommends the following edits: R.7 Preserve an original roof component such as a cupola, dormer, or chimney. • Preserve decorative elements associated with a roof including crests and chimneys. • <u>If these elements are not visible from the public way and are not character defining, then removal can be considered.</u>
Not Incorporated Previously	R.11 Install a new dormer to be minimally visible. • Place a new dormer on a rear elevation. • Design a dormer to be appropriately-scaled to the historic roof form.	Staff recommends the following edits: R.11 Install a new dormer to be minimally visible. • Place a new dormer on a rear elevation. • <u>If a rear elevation is not possible, then the dormer shall be appropriately located on a secondary elevation and setback from the front façade.</u> • Design a dormer to be appropriately-scaled to the historic roof form.

Current Standard Guidelines	Nore' Winter's Draft	Staff Suggestions
Not Incorporated Previously	R.14 Do not remove original roof components.	Staff recommends deleting as this is vague.
Not Incorporated Previously	R.17 Install new technology in a reversible manner. • Install technology in such a way that it can be readily removed and the original character easily restored. • Use materials that are environmentally-friendly and that will not interact negatively with historic building materials. • Attach turbines in a manner that avoids damage to significant features. • Install turbines to allow restoration of affected building areas. • Install turbines as freestanding structures in unobtrusive locations when feasible. • Do not overload structural or roof protection systems when attaching turbines.	