

Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To: Limerick Architectural Review Committee
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Iná Nakao, Historic Preservation Specialist

Date: September 8, 2023

Case No: 23-COA-0232 Classification: Committee Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 918 S. 6th St.

Applicant: Wayne Esterle

918 S 6th St.

Louisville, KY 40203 (502) 583-4786

wayne@inbloomagain.com

Owner: same as applicant

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to paint the brick walls of the building with a grey color, which is SW 7074 manufactured by Sherwin Williams. The largest portion of brick has never been painted. Only small areas on the front and sides had been previously painted with a red color that matches the color of the brick.

The applicant also proposes to paint non-masonry building elements, which is considered general maintenance and does not require a COA. These elements are the doors, to be painted in a red color; door frames and metal awning soffit, to be painted gray; and window trims, to be painted black. The concrete storefront and window sills and the concrete trim on top of the front façade wall shall remain unpainted.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on August 23, 2023 and considered to require committee level review. A Limerick Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting is scheduled for September 13, 2023 at 5:30 PM at 444 S. 5th Street, room 101.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for the Limerick Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Masonry** and **Paint**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The property is located on the west side of S. 6th St., five parcels south of the intersection with W. Breckinridge St. It is zoned TNZD within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The structure is a one-story, masonry, circa 1950 midcentury, infill commercial building. It has multiple large gangs of full length, storefront windows, and an angled front entrance with a single door and glass block sidelights and a rounded, flat metal awning.

On May 19, 2021, staff approved COA# 21-COA-0068 for the restoration of the storefront. On May 16, 2022, staff approved COA# 22-SIGNPERMIT-0246 for the installation of a sign on the front façade. On September 7, 2023 staff approved COA# 23-COA-0237 for the installation of a door on the side elevation and another on the rear elevation.

Conclusions

The proposed work generally does not meet the Limerick design guidelines for Masonry and Paint. Most of the brick on the building have never been painted except for a small portion that was painted without a COA between 2017 and 2018 with a red color that matches the brick. This was most likely done to cover graffiti. These portions are located on the front (east), north, and south façades (**Figures 1, 2, and 3**). The brick on southeast angled front entry and the rear façade have never been painted (**Figure 4**). The north façade, except for the small area shown in **Figure 1**, has also never been painted.



Figure 1: North side façade, painted area marked in yellow, staff photo.



Figure 2: East front façade, painted areas marked in yellow, PVA photo Nov. 2021.



Figure 3: South side façade, painted area marked in yellow, PVA photo Nov. 2021.



Figure 4: West rear and north side façade, PVA photo, Nov. 2021.

Since more than 80% of the brick has never been painted, the proposed painting does not conform with guidelines **P1** and **M24**. Furthermore, the unpainted brick on the west rear and north side façades has a rough texture and soft consistency, thus it is more likely to be damaged with paint. For this reason, staff finds that this brick should remain unpainted.

However, if the proposed painting of the building exterior were to be approved by the Limerick ARC, staff finds the proposed grey color to conform with the guidelines, as it approximates a natural masonry color, and it has been used in the district.

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends that the Certification of Appropriateness be **denied** as it does not meet the guidelines for Masonry and Paint.

However, should the ARC determine that the painting of the building exterior meets the guidelines, then staff recommends the following conditions of approval:

- Only the red smooth brick on the east front and south side façades and a small area of the same brick that wraps around the north façade and the west rear facade shall be painted. The brick with a rough texture on the west rear and north façades shall remain unpainted.
- 2. The concrete storefront and window sills and the concrete trim on top of the front façade wall shall remain unpainted.
- 3. A breathable masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint shall be used.
- 4. If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact staff for review and approval.

Ana' Nakao	09/08/2023	
Iná Nakao	Date	
Historic Preservation Specialist		

MASONRY

Design Guideline Checklist

- Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
M1	Do not construct new masonry features that are either falsely historical (characteristic of periods prior to the building's actual construction) or are incompatible with the building or historic district in terms of size, scale, material, or color.	NA	
M2	Do not cut new openings into exterior walls on elevations that can be seen from a public way. Creating an opening for the installation of an air conditioning unit, for example, is not appropriate for a façade that is visible from a public way.	NA	
М3	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	NA	
M4	Match the existing bonding pattern, coursing, color, size, strength, and pointing mortar of masonry when replacing a section of brick wall. Bricks should always be toothed-in to historic brickwork, to disguise the joint between new and old.	NA	

M5	Do not remove or rebuild substantial portions of exterior walls if such an action would adversely impact a structure's historic integrity.	NA
М6	Make sure that any exterior replacement bricks are suited for exterior use.	NA
М7	Do not replace sections of historic brick with brick that is substantially stronger.	NA
M8	Repoint only those joints that are no longer sound. Do not remove all joints, sound and unsound, in an effort to achieve a uniform appearance when repointing. Large-scale removal of mortar joints often results in damage to historic masonry.	NA
М9	Remove unsound mortar joints carefully with hand tools that are narrower than the mortar joint. Power tools should not be used, because they have the potential to scar adjacent masonry.	NA
M10	Remove unsound mortar to a depth of two-and-one-half the times the width of the joint or to sound mortar, whichever is greater.	NA
M11	Match historic mortar joints in color, texture, joint size, and tooling when repointing.	NA
M12	Use a mortar mix that is compatible with historic masonry. Repointing mortar should be equivalent to or softer than the original mortar. When repointing mortar is harder than the surrounding masonry, as is the case with many modern mixtures, moisture cannot escape through the joints. Trapped moisture will crystallize within the walls and fragment surrounding brick and stone.	NA
M13	If possible, have your mortar analyzed. In order to determine an appropriate mortar mix for individual historic structures, it is recommended that property owners have a sample of the original mortar sent to a lab for analysis. If this is not feasible, a high lime and low Portland cement content mortar mix (1 part cement, 1 part lime, and 6 parts sand) is frequently acceptable.	NA
M14	Do not attempt to remove joints that have been repointed using a very hard mortar or in an unworkmanlike manner until natural weathering has begun to weaken and crack them. Removal prior to that time would likely damage the masonry units	NA
M15	Do not use synthetic caulking to repoint historic masonry.	NA
M16	Have realistic expectations of how the cleaned masonry surface will appear. Remember, it is better to underclean than overclean. A "like new" appearance is rarely desirable.	NA
M17	Make sure that your contractor has a clear understanding of the physical and chemical properties of your masonry before proposing or testing any chemical cleaning treatments. Such treatments, if improperly applied, can result in permanent damage that significantly outweighs any benefits of cleaning.	NA
M18	Test proposed cleaning treatments in an inconspicuous area of the building to evaluate potential adverse effects to the masonry. Observation over a complete seasonal cycle is preferable, so that long-term effects may be ascertained. If chemical treatments are found to be acceptable, be sure that those applying the treatment follow all manufacturers' instructions.	NA
M19	Do not use sandblasting or high-pressure water to clean historic masonry. The process of sandblasting or cleaning buildings using water pressure greater than 300 psi removes the tough, outer-protective surface of the brick and loosens mortar joints, accelerating deterioration.	NA

M20	Do not clean masonry on buildings with deteriorated mortar joints. Such masonry should be properly repointed prior to cleaning to ensure that water does not penetrate the wall during the cleaning process.	NA	
M21	Do not use any type of water- or chemical-based cleaning systems when a possibility for freezing temperatures exists. Masonry cleaning should not be undertaken until the temperature will remain above 50 degrees for 72 hours after cleaning.	NA	
M22	Remove graffiti as soon as possible, beginning with the gentlest means possible and taking care not to inadvertently etch an outline of the graffiti onto the wall.	NA	
M23	Use solvent-based chemical strippers to remove paint from previously-painted masonry only after testing its effectiveness and evaluating its potential to damage brickwork. Testing should be carried out in an inconspicuous location.	NA	
M24	Do not paint masonry or stucco that has never been painted. While one layer of paint may not affect the appearance of the masonry or stucco, accumulated layers will eventually obscure decorative detail.	-	More than 80% of the bricks have never been painted.
M25	Paint previously-painted masonry a color that is close to its existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	+	The proposed grey color approximates a natural masonry color. However, the existing color on a portion of the brick is red.
M26	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint.	NSI	See conditions of approval
M27	Make sure that areas of patched stucco match the strength, composition, color, and texture of the original to the greatest degree possible.	NA	
M28	When patching stucco, cut back the successive layers to provide a key for the new layers to prevent new cracking.	NA	
M29	Carry out stucco repairs so that the dimension between the surface of the stucco and adjacent finishes remains unchanged.	NA	
M30	Do not install stucco, Dryvit, or permastone-type cladding over historic masonry or wood siding.	NA	
M31	Do not resurface historic masonry with exterior insulation.	NA	
M32	Use a masonry or terra cotta chimney cap if needed. Metal chimney caps are not historically appropriate.	NA	

PAINT

Design Guideline Checklist

- Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
P1	Painting masonry or stucco that has never been painted is not recommended. Paint is difficult to remove, accumulated layers will obscure decorative detail, and paint coatings (even "breathable" paints) will affect the wall's vapor transmission performance. The presence of a lead oxide wash does not constitute a precedent for painting a building.	-	More than 80% of the bricks have never been painted.
P2	When removing paint from previously-painted masonry, use gentle treatments that have been previously tested in an inconspicuous location. Do not sandblast or use acid-based cleaners.	NA	
Р3	Use a "breathable" masonry paint that is compatible with and can create a strong bond with existing paint, only on previously-painted masonry.	NSI	See conditions of approval
P4	If painting previously-painted masonry, select a color that matches the existing color, approximates a natural masonry color as approved, or is recommended by the staff. Staff is available to consult with you on appropriate colors.	+	The proposed grey color approximates a natural masonry color. However, the existing color on a portion of the brick is red.
P5	Have paint samples analyzed when possible. Paint seriation studies can determine historic pigments and appropriate colors for repainting, by analyzing a paint sample under special lighting conditions to ascertain specific color, hue, and value of paint layers.	NA	
P6	Do not expose metal types that require protection from the elements or apply paint or other coatings to metals that were historically meant to be exposed, such as copper, bronze, or stainless steel.	NA	
P7	Paint replacement gutters, downspouts, metal frame screen and storm windows, roof-vent assemblies, and fire escapes to match wall, trim, cornice, or roof color of the house, whichever is most effective in reducing the visibility of these elements.	NA	
P8	Be aware that historic structures often contain hazardous substances, such as lead paint and asbestos. Contact the Board of Health regarding proper methods of removal and disposal.	NA	