



Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts
Commission

Certificate of Appropriateness

To: Doug Foster, Louisville Free Public Library
Thru: Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From: Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date: May 1, 2023

Case No: 23-COA-0051
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 2743 Virginia Avenue

Applicant: Doug Foster
Louisville Free Public Library
301 York Street
Louisville, KY 40203
(502) 432-7898 / (502) 574-1655
doug.foster@lfpl.org

Owner: same as applicant

Architect: Colin L. Drake
JRA Architects
829 East Market Street, Suite B
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 657-5990
cdrake@jrarchitects.com

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:

The applicant seeks approval to construct a new 1,740 sf, modular, two-story, attached addition on the northwest, rear elevation of the existing Carnegie Library building. The proposed addition will be subordinate to the original building. The roofline of the new addition's flat-style roof will be constructed below the soffit of the original building. The existing structure has a height of 27'-2" and the proposed addition will have a height of 23'-6". Modular Lighthouse Velour brick will be added to the north and south walls of the new addition to match the existing brick of the library's original structure. Historically accurate clay roof tiles will be added to replace damaged units of the existing roof. Limestone trim will be added in limited quantities around the new

addition to complement the library's existing main structure. The east, west, and south elevations of the new addition will be inset with large clear tempered glass panel windows.

The applicant seeks approval to replace the existing double-entry doors on the front façade of the structure with a new single-entry door and sidelight. The applicant proposes to install a new front entry stairwell, new paver patio seating terrace, and concrete walkways at the front, south side of the property facing Virginia Ave. A new parking area and concrete walkway are proposed on the east side of the property, as well as an additional pedestrian entrance on the east elevation of the building. Two new egress stairwells are proposed on the west side and east side of the structure.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application

The application was received on March 16, 2023. The application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Staff Review on March 20, 2023.

FINDINGS

Guidelines

The following design review guidelines, approved for Individual Landmarks, are applicable to the proposed exterior alterations: **New Construction-Commercial, Addition, Site, and Door**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background

The building is located on the northeast corner of S. 28th Street and Virginia Avenue. It is zoned C-2 and is within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The Parkland Branch is significant as the first library branch in the Louisville Free Public Library system built in a western streetcar suburb. Regionally prominent local architect Brinton B. Davis was responsible for the design of this handsome Classical Revival style building. The masonry structure was constructed in 1908, listed in the National Register in June 1980 and locally designated as an Individual Landmark in 2002.

Conclusions

The proposed addition generally meets the Individual Landmarks Design Guidelines for **New Construction-Commercial, Addition, and Site**. The proposed addition is 1,740 SF and the existing historic structure is 3,120 SF. Although the square footage of the new addition slightly exceeds half of the square footage of the existing structure, the difference is minimal, and the design and mass are complementary to the existing historic structure and district. The new addition will have a flat style roof. The top of the new roof will align with the soffits of the existing roofline of the historic structure. The new addition will have a more modern, modular design, with large inset glass panel windows and masonry walls to complement the large arched windows and masonry walls of the historic structure. There are slightly more window openings than the historic structure; however, this design helps articulate the difference between the new addition and the historic structure.

The proposed door replacement generally does not meet the applicable Individual Landmarks design guidelines for **Door**. It is unknown when the front façade double doors were replaced but the library has always had double doors. Thus, the replacement doors will remain double doors and will be placed on the same location as the existing (**Figure 1**).



Figure 1. Historic Photo showing Parkland Branch Library main entrance (Unknown source).

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, staff recommends the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions**:

1. The front façade door shall be a double door that is historically appropriate to the period and style of the building. The applicant shall submit to Landmarks Staff cut sheets of the new double-entry door prior to installation.
2. Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work. Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.
3. The new front railing shall be submitted to staff for review and approval.
4. Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.
5. Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings.

6. Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.
7. Any new concrete shall be historic concrete mix.
8. Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.
9. Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.
10. Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, lighting should have an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.
11. Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way.
12. Install utility lines underground whenever possible.
13. If the scope of the project, or material choices change the applicant shall contact staff for approval prior.

The foregoing information is hereby incorporated in the Certificate of Appropriateness as approved and is binding upon the applicant, their successors, heirs or assigns. This Certificate does not relieve the applicant of responsibility for obtaining the necessary permits and approvals required by other governing agencies or authorities.



Priscilla Bowman
Historic Preservation Specialist

05/01/2023

Date

NEW CONSTRUCTION

COMMERCIAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other applicable regulations including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+	A Community Facilities Review was completed under case # 23-CFR-0006
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	This is a new addition attached to the rear of an existing historic structure. The existing historic structure will remain.
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, scale, massing, volume, directional emphasis, and setback reflects the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+	The existing historic building is 3,120 sf and the new addition will be 1,740 sf. The total height of the new addition is shorter and will match with the existing cornice line of the historic structure.
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the district.	+	
NC5	Select materials and design elements for new construction that are sympathetic with surrounding historic buildings in the district. Materials should be of a complementary color, size, texture, scale, and level of craftsmanship.	+	Using limestone trim and Modular Lighthouse Velour brick to match the trim and brick of the existing structure.
NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+	
NC7	Have new construction reinforce the human scale of historic districts by emphasizing the base of the building where this is a character-defining feature.	+	
NC8	Design infill construction that enhances the pedestrian-oriented character of historic commercial districts. Commercial buildings should have a well-defined base at the pedestrian level with details conveying a sense of horizontality and progression along the sidewalk.	NA	This is a new addition to an existing historic structure.
NC9	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	
NC10	Plant canopy trees in front of any large-scale new construction to provide a visual sense of consistency along a streetscape.	+	
NC11	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+	The proposed addition will have new walkways, landscaping, and a seating terrace.

NC12	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	
NC13	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	This is an addition to an existing historic structure.
NC14	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weightiness as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solid surfaces (walls) to voids (window and door openings).	+	The new addition will have a more modern, modular design, with large glass panel windows and masonry walls to complement the large arched windows and masonry walls of the historic structure.
NC15	Maintain historic patterns of window and door proportion and placement in designs for new construction.	+	The new addition will have new large inset glass panel windows to complement the existing large arched windows of the historic structure.
NC16	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+/-	The new addition will have new large inset glass panel windows to complement the existing large arched windows of the historic structure.
NC17	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	The existing front entry door of the historic structure will remain.
NC18	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street.	NA	The main entrance is located on the existing historic structure and will remain.
NC19	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	+	
NC20	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	+	
NC21	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a way that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC22	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings. The rhythm of the façade should also reflect the characteristic rhythm of existing buildings on the street. Vertical elements (doors, columns, and storefronts) should be spaced approximately every 20 to 40 feet at the pedestrian level.	NA	This is an addition to an existing historic structure.
NC23	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC24	Incorporate set-back upper stories into designs for new construction that exceed the established cornice line.	+	
NC25	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block. New construction should be built out to the property lines where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	

NC26	Historic commercial properties have long been anchors in Louisville's preservation districts. Construction of commercial properties on vacant corner lots should preferably be built to the corner with an entrance oriented to the corner.	NA	This is a new addition attached to the rear of an existing historic structure.
NC27	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	NA	
NC28	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	The existing historic structure has a hipped style roof and the proposed addition will have a flat style roof. The existing historic building is 3,120 sf and the new addition will be 1,740 sf. The total height of the new addition is shorter and will match with the existing cornice line of the historic structure.
NC29	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominate form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominate form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	NA	
NC30	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC31	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC32	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	NA	
NC33	Make provisions for screening and storage of trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval
NC34	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings.	+	See conditions of approval
NC35	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction.	+	Using limestone trim and Modular Lighthouse Velour brick to match the trim and brick of the existing structure.
NC36	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	See comment above.
NC37	Design parking garages so that they relate closely to adjacent structures. Their facades should reflect the hierarchical organization and design elements seen on surrounding buildings.	NA	
NC38	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	
NC39	Generally, leave at least 20 percent of a parking lot's surface area unpaved and planted. All parking lots must meet the minimum requirements of the city's Development Code. Perimeter landscaping, fencing, colonnades, or other construction that visually continues the building line along open sidewalks is encouraged.	+	Existing parking area will remain. A Community Facilities Review was completed under 23-CFR-0006. See conditions of approval.
NC40	Generally speaking, parking should be located in the rear.	+/-	Existing parking area is located on the east, side area of the property.

NC41	Design required new parking in such a way that it is as unobtrusive as possible and minimizes the impact on the historic setting. Shared parking areas among groups of businesses is encouraged.	NA	See comment(s) above.
NC42	Do not build additional surface parking lots within the West Main Preservation District.	NA	
NC43	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval
NC44	Do not create additional open space within the West Main Historic District.	NA	

ADDITION

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
A1	Ensure that the design of any new addition is in proportion with the size and scale of the historic building and district.	+	The new addition is 1,740 SF and the existing structure is 3,120 SF. The top of the flat-style roof of the proposed addition will fall in line with the soffits of the existing historic structure.
A2	Design any addition so that it is subordinate to the original building. Generally, additions should not exceed half of the original building's total floor area or building footprint.	+/-	The new addition is 1,740 SF and the existing historic structure is 3,120 SF. Although the proposed square footage of the new addition slightly exceeds half of the square footage of the existing structure, the difference is minimal, and the design and mass is complementary of the existing historic structure and district.
A3	Generally, additions should be attached to secondary elevations and should be set back from the front façade, so as not to damage or obscure character-defining features.	+	The proposed addition will be attached to the rear, north elevation of the existing structure and will not damage or obscure its character-defining features.
A4	Use materials that are the same as or subordinate to the primary material of the original building. Wood is subordinate to brick, and brick and stucco are subordinate to stone.	+	Using limestone trim and Modular Lighthouse Velour brick to match the trim and brick of the existing structure. Using new large tempered glass panel windows to complement the existing large arched windows of the historic structure.

A5	Respect original roof forms when designing an addition. Additions should complement existing forms, not overwhelm them.	+	The new addition will have a flat style roof. The top of the new roof will align with the soffits of the existing roofline of the historic structure.
A6	Do not undertake any full-floor additions in residential preservation districts (adding an additional full floor on top of a building).	NA	
A7	Generally, the original orientation of a building should not be altered when constructing a new addition. An addition should not turn a secondary façade into primary façade.	+	The new addition will be attached on the rear façade of the existing historic structure. The main entrance of existing historic structure will remain.
A8	Design any new addition so that the first-floor height is equal to or slightly lower than the original building. The floor-to-floor heights should be equal to or up to 10 percent less than the original building. In no case should the floor heights exceed those of the original building.	+	
A9	Design additions to have the same relationship of solids (wall surfaces) to voids (window and door openings) as the historic portion.	+/-	The new addition will have a more modern, modular design, with large inset glass panel windows and masonry walls to complement the large arched windows and masonry walls of the historic structure. There are slightly more window openings than the historic structure; however, this design helps articulate the difference between the new addition and the historic structure.
A10	Design additions so that there are subtle distinguishing characteristics between the historic portion and the new alteration. This may include simplifying details, changing materials, or slightly altering proportion.	+	The new addition will have a more modern, modular design, with large inset glass panel windows and masonry walls to complement the large arched windows and masonry walls of the historic structure
A11	Set back additional stories from the historic wall plane of commercial or institutional structures when such an approach is required for a new use. The construction of additional stories should be as inconspicuous as possible and not damage or destroy character-defining features.	+	
A12	Do not design additions to appear older than the original building.	+	The new addition has a more modern, modular design, and does not appear older than the original building.
A13	Comply with the Kentucky building code in such a way that a historic building's character-defining features are preserved.	+	See conditions of approval
A14	Do not radically change or damage a building's character-defining features when adding a new code-required stairway or elevator. Any such addition should be compatible with the materials and scale of the historic structure.	+	See conditions of approval
A15	Install fire escapes only on secondary elevations. Respect the locations of original doors and windows and do not cause undue damage to historic materials. They should preferably be painted to match the color of the wall.	NA	

A16	Do not construct a deck on a front or side façade. Decks should be of wood construction and be either painted or finished with an opaque stain. Use the railing detail developed by the Landmarks Commission or other approved detail.	NA	
A17	Design rear decks so that they do not extend beyond the side walls of the house and are not visible from the street.	NA	
A18	Wood fire stairs should be painted or stained and should be kept to a minimum functional size.	NA	

SITE

Design Guideline Checklist

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
ST1	Consider the relationships that exist between the site and structure when making exterior alterations. Changes to one will affect the other. A primary goal should be to maintain a complementary relationship.	+	
ST2	Retain established property line patterns and street and alley widths. Any replatting should be consistent with original development patterns.	NA	
ST3	Use paving materials that are compatible with adjacent sites and architectural character.	+	
ST4	Restore and reuse historic paving materials for streets and sidewalks such as brick and hexagonal pavers and limestone curbing. Maintain original curbing whenever possible. The historic relationship between the road surface and edging should be preserved. Any replacement should use historic materials. If replacement with original materials is not technically or economically feasible, a substitute material may be used if it duplicates the color, texture, and visual appearance of the original.	+	See conditions of approval
ST5	Maintain brick, stone, or poured concrete steps wherever present. If replacement is required, original materials should be used. New construction should incorporate steps on blocks where they are a character-defining feature.	+	Replacing the existing front entry concrete stairway and adding two new egress stairwells on the east and west sides of the proposed addition. See conditions of approval.
ST6	Do not harm historic resources through road widening or underground utility repair.	NA	
ST7	Locate driveways, parking areas, and loading docks to the side and rear of properties. Access from alleys is preferred.	+	

ST8	Maintain original front yard topography, including grades, slopes, elevations, and earthen berms where present. New construction should match the grade of adjacent properties. Do not recontour front-yard berms into stepped terraces, using railroad ties, landscape timbers, or any other historically-inappropriate material for retaining walls.	+	
ST9	Do not carry out excavations or regrading within or adjacent to a historic building, which could cause the foundation to shift or destroy significant archeological resources.	+	See conditions of approval
ST10	Do not install masonry walls in street-visible locations unless they are used to retain earth at changes in grade, screen service areas, or unless a historic precedent exists.	NA	
ST11	Use materials that match existing sections of historic fencing in material, height, and detail when carrying out limited replacement projects. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST12	use materials that match the existing character of the original when replacing retaining walls or curbing. If an exact match cannot be made, a simplified design is appropriate.	NA	
ST13	Install only historically-compatible iron fencing under 2'-5" in height where there is demonstrable historic precedent.	NA	
ST14	Do not install front-yard fencing where there is no historic precedent.	NA	
ST15	Install any rear- or side-yard privacy fencing so that it is set back from the side wall at least two feet and presents the finished side out. Any privacy fencing should be less than seven feet in height. Contact the Department of Inspections, Permits, and Licenses regarding additional restrictions on fencing at corner properties.	NA	
ST16	Do not install chain-link, split-rail, or woven-wood fencing, or concrete block walls in areas that are visible from a public way. Opaque fencing, such as painted or stained pressure-treated wood, may be permitted with appropriate design.	NA	
ST17	Use understated fixtures when installing any type of exterior lighting. Fixture attachment should be done so as not to damage historic fabric. Fixtures should not become a visual focal point.	+	See conditions of approval
ST18	Do not light parking areas or architectural features in a harsh manner. Generally, an average illumination level of 1.5 to 2.0 foot-candles will be sufficient. Light should be directed down and away from neighboring properties.	+	See conditions of approval
ST19	Parking lots of a certain size should have a portion of the parking area dedicated to plantings that will soften the expanse of paving. See the Jefferson County Development Code - Requirements for Landscaping and Land Use Buffers for specific requirements.	NA	Existing parking area will remain. A Community Facilities Review was completed under 23-CFR-0006. See conditions of approval.
ST20	Use high-pressure sodium or metal halide lights to create a soft illumination where site or streetscape lighting is desired.	NA	
ST21	Position fixtures, such as air conditioning units, satellite dishes, greenhouse additions, and overhead wiring, on secondary elevations where they do not detract from the character of the site. Try to minimize noise levels to adjacent properties.	+	Utility units will be located on the roof of the new rear addition.
ST22	Preserve large trees whenever possible and enhance established street tree patterns by planting additional trees along public rights-of-way. Consult the city arborist to determine what tree species are suitable for placement near overhead wires. Select and place street trees so that the plantings will not obscure historic storefronts once mature. Removal of trees within or immediately adjacent to a public right-of-way or within public open spaces requires review unless directed by the city arborist for emergency or public safety reasons.	+	See conditions of approval

ST23	Ensure that all proposed cellular towers and associated fixtures will be properly screened from view.	NA	
ST24	Install utility lines underground whenever possible.	+	See conditions of approval

DOOR

Design Guideline Checklist

- + Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
- +/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
- NA Not Applicable
- NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
D1	Do not alter the character of entrances by either removing historic elements or through the addition of elements for which there is no historic precedent.	-	Changing a double door configuration to a single door with sidelights does not meet this. See conditions of approval.
D2	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric	+	
D3	Use historical, pictorial, and physical documentation when undertaking the reconstruction of a missing entrance or porch feature. If there is not sufficient information to determine the original design, a new design should be prepared that is compatible with the architectural character of the building and the district. Conjectural or falsely-historical designs are not appropriate.	+/-	See conditions of approval
D4	Use only those replacement doors that duplicate the design, proportion, and arrangement of paneling and glazing of the original.	+/-	See conditions of approval
D5	Do not replace historic double leaf doors with a single door.	-	Conditions of approval require the front door to remain double leaf
D6	Do not alter original openings to accommodate stock doors.	+	
D7	Install only screen doors or storm doors that are simple with a narrow-frame design that enables the inner door to be seen. Metal screen and storm doors should be painted or finished to match the inner door.	NA	
D8	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original doors or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grilles should retract out of sight during business hours and preferably be mounted inside the glass. Painting security bars an unobtrusive color is recommended.	NA	
D9	Differentiate between primary and secondary doors, using the detailing of the doors or the articulation of the frame.	+	Primary and secondary entrances are differentiated
D10	Do not add vestibules to primary facades unless there is a historic precedent. Such additions alter the character, proportion, and massing of the façade.	NA	

D11	Do not create new entrances on facades that can be seen from a public way.	NA	
D12	Replacement of non-original, non-historic doors with new doors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building and are the size of the original opening is recommended.	+/-	See conditions of approval