Historic Landmarks and Preservation Districts Commission

Report to the Committee

To:	Butchertown Architectural Review Committee
Thru:	Savannah Darr, Historic Preservation Officer
From:	Priscilla Bowman, Historic Preservation Specialist
Date:	May 26, 2023

Case No: 23-COA-0080
Classification: Staff Review

GENERAL INFORMATION

Property Address: 911 Franklin Street

Applicant:
Jeff Rawlins
Architectural Artisans
213 S. Shelby Street
Louisville, KY 40206
(502) 582-3907
jr@architecturalartisans.net

Owner:
Scott M. Howe, Jr.
911 Franklin Street
Louisville, KY 40206

Estimated Project Cost: TBD

Description of proposed exterior alteration:
The applicant requests approval to demolish three existing additions at the rear of the home: a one-story, brick addition; a one-story, frame, shed roof addition; and a two-story frame addition.

The applicant then requests approval for the new construction of three new additions, totaling 3,270 SF:

1. The first addition proposed will be a 9' x 18', one-story, wood framed, glass sunroom addition. This addition will be attached to the east side of the masonry home. The addition will be setback approximately 36' from the front façade. It will have a hip roof that ties into the historic, main hip roofline.
2. The second addition proposed will be a larger, multi-part, two-story addition with a stair tower and rooftop deck. The addtion is somewhat L-shaped and will be attached to the rear of the masonry home extending overtop of the existing detached CMU garage in the rear of

the property. The total height of the rear addition, including the stair tower and rooftop deck, will be 33'H. The front, south-façade will have two new picture windows facing Franklin Street. A new glass-walled stair enclosure will be located on the west façade, between the existing home and rear garage. Two, 2'-8", square aluminum windows will be added to the west façade of the second-story addition above the existing garage. One large window will be added on the north elevation of the second-story addition above the garage. One, vertically oriented rectangular full-lite window will be added to the east elevation of the new second-story addition above the existing garage. Allfaçades of this addition will be clad in vertical metal siding.

3. The third addition will be a two-story, shed roof addition attached to the east side of the new rear addition to the house and to the south of the existing garage. The two-story south-facing elevation will be clad with an aluminum framed floor to ceiling window wall, and the east-facing elevation will be clad with vertical metal siding to match that on the other proposed additions.

Lastly, the applicant also requests approval to remove three existing windows on the west side elevation of the existing masonry home. The openings are proposed to be bricked in.

Communications with Applicant, Completion of Application
The application was received on April 10, 2023 and the application was determined to be complete and classified as requiring Committee Review that same day.

A Butchertown Architectural Review Committee (ARC) meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, May 31, 2023 at 4:30PM in room 101 of the Metro Development Center, located at 444 S. 5th St.

FINDINGS

Guidelines
The following design review guidelines, approved for the Butchertown Preservation District, are applicable to the proposed exterior alteration: **Demolition**, **New Construction Residential**, and **Window**. The report of the Commission Staff's findings of fact and conclusions with respect to these guidelines is attached to this report.

The following additional findings are incorporated in this report:

Site Context/ Background
The property is located on the north side of Franklin Street, five lots east of the intersection of N. Campbell Street and Franklin Street. The property is zoned R6 within the Traditional Neighborhood Form District. The masonry, shotgun style house has a hip roof and a two-story camelback addition. The house retains the original windows on the front and side elevations as well as decorative detailing characteristic of the Italianate Architectural Style (cornice brackets, window hoods, and bracketed door detail).

Conclusions
The proposed demolition of three rear additions generally meet the Butchertown design guidelines for **Demolition**. The three later additions at the rear of the original masonry home

are not character defining. Their removal will not impact the integrity of the historic home or its ability to be contributing to the district as a whole. As noted in the conditions of approval, the demolition shall be done carefully as to not threaten the remaining shotgun house.

The proposed construction of three new additions generally meet the Butchertown design guidelines for **New Construction Residential**. Most residential properties in the District are designed to have the main structure, private yard, and then possibly an accessory structure. However, this lot and others along this block of Franklin Street have slightly deeper front yards and smaller rear yards. This lot specifically already has additions and a garage in the rear, leaving a small portion of yard. Thus, staff believes that the additions filling the rear yard, leaving little to no actual rear yard space, does not negatively impact this property or the District as a whole. However, the proposed additions may exceed the maximum private yard area requirements as outline in the Land Development Code. The applicant shall check with the Zoning department to determine whether a Variance is needed.

The proposed 33-ft building height is complementary of the diverse building heights of the surrounding buildings. Although these are large additions overall, they are set far back (approximately 53 feet) from the front street and generally use glass materials in a manner that minimizes their observable size. However, the massing on the east side of the additions is quite large with little to no glass or material change. Staff recommends the east side be broken up with different cladding materials and/or window openings to mitigate the solid massing. This would allow the elevation to be more in keeping with **NC3** and **NC12**. The east side sunroom addition complements the existing historic home and surrounding structures. It is located where a traditional secondary shotgun entrance could be located. The use of glass speaks to its modern design while complementing the historic architecture.

The proposed vertical metal siding is not a similar nor compatible material to those of other surrounding historic buildings, which does not meet **NC5**, **NC6**, and **NC30**. While Butchertown is known for its industrial character as an overall district, this block of Franklin Street is more traditional in its design. Even the modern infill utilizes traditional materials. The modern design of the additions is encouraged to differentiate them from the historic structure; however, the metal material in combination with the low slope roof design appears too industrial for this block. Staff recommends a different material that is more complementary to the traditional architecture of the surrounding buildings while still visually reading as a modern addition.

The proposed addition and removal of windows generally meets the Butchertown design guidelines for **Window**. The west, north, and east façade windows of the new additions, although more modern, complement the historic structure and surrounding structures in their placement and design. The applicant proposes to brick over three windows on the west side elevation. Two of the northernmost windows appear to not be original to the home, one of which is already infilled with glass block. However, the southernmost window visible from Franklin Street appears to be an historic 6/6 double-hung wood window. It appears to be original to the home, so its removal would not meet **W14**. Thus, Staff recommends that it not be bricked in and remain as-is (see conditions of approval).

RECOMMENDATION

On the basis of the information furnished by the applicant, Staff recommends that the application for a Certificate of Appropriateness be **approved with the following conditions:**

1. **The proposed vertical metal siding shall be changed to a material more complementary to the traditional architectural surrounding while still reading modern.**
2. **The massing of the east side façade of the rear addition shall be broken up with different materials or openings to mitigate the scale.**
3. **The southernmost window on the west side elevation of the historic shotgun shall not be bricked in. It shall remain as-is.**
4. **Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.**
5. **Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.**
6. **Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations. The proposed addition may exceed the private yard area requirement per zoning code (a Variance may be needed).**
7. **Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.**
8. **Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.**
9. **Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, reflective film, or insulating glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way. Clear low-E is permissible.**
10. **If the design or materials change, the applicant shall contact Landmarks staff for review and approval.**
11. **All other necessary permits and approval shall be obtained prior to construction.**

Priscilla Bowman
Historic Preservation Specialist

05-26-2023
Date

DEMOLITION

Design Guideline Checklist
From Economic Hardship Exemption

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

Introduction
Unless the city has determined that it poses an imminent threat to life or property, do not demolish any historic structure or part of a historic structure that contributes to the integrity of any historic district, or any individual landmark or part of an individual landmark.

Demolition by Neglect
The deteriorated condition of a historic building attributable to the owner's failure to provide proper maintenance over an extended period of time will not be considered a mitigating circumstance in evaluations of economic hardship. Hardship that is attributable to a building's being allowed to deteriorate will be considered self-imposed; restoration costs incurred to remediate such neglect will not be considered.

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
DE1	Do not demolish existing non-contributing buildings and additions in a manner that will threaten the integrity of existing contributing structures.	+	See conditions of approval
DE2	Do take steps to assure the integrity of a wall exposed to the elements by the removal of a non-historic addition.	+	See conditions of approval
DE3	Do remove non-historic interior finishes such as plaster, drywall, or paneling that may be exposed as a result of the removal of non-historic additions.	+	
DE4	Do infill non-historic openings in historic walls, exposed as a result of the removal of the non-historic finishes.	NA	
DE5	Do landscape areas that are left vacant as the result of removals of non-contributing buildings and additions. Topography should be made consistent with that of adjacent properties. The slope and grades of land left vacant after demolition should continue and be consistent with those features on adjacent properties.	NA	
DE6	Do take measures to reestablish the street wall after demolition through the use of low fences, walls, and/or vegetation.	+	New additions are proposed.

NEW CONSTRUCTION

RESIDENTIAL DESIGN GUIDELINES

+	Meets Guidelines
-	Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/-	Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA	Not Applicable
NSI	Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
NC1	Make sure that new designs conform to all other municipal regulations, including the Jefferson County Development Code and Zoning District Regulations.	+/-	The proposed additions may exceed the maximum private yard area requirements as outline in the Land Development Code. The applicant shall check with the Zoning department to determine whether a Variance is needed. See conditions of approval.
NC2	Do not demolish contributing structures in a historic district to make way for new or large-scale construction. Non-contributing buildings are identified in each of the district or individual landmark designations or National Register nominations.	NA	
NC3	Design new construction so that the building height, directional emphasis, scale, massing, and volume reflect the architectural context established by surrounding structures.	+/-	The proposed building height complements the diverse building heights of the surrounding area. The massing of the east side façade should be broken up with different materials or openings to mitigate the scale (see conditions of approval).
NC4	Make sure that the scale of new construction does not conflict with the historic character of the neighborhood.	+/-	Although these are large additions, they are set farther back from the front street and placed in a manner that lessens the observable size.
NC5	Incorporate materials and design elements that complement the color, size, texture, and level of craftsmanship seen in surrounding buildings.	+/-	The east side sunroom addition complements the existing historic home and surrounding structures. However, the vertical metal siding is not a compatible material for the historic home and surrounding buildings. An alternative material that is more complementary of the surrounding traditional architecture would be more appropriate (see conditions of approval).

NC6	Do not use materials in new construction that are visually incompatible with surrounding historic buildings within the district. Materials to be avoided include: ornamental pierced concrete masonry screens and walls, "antiqued" brick, wrought-iron porch columns, chain-link fencing, exterior carpeting, jalousie windows, glass block, picture windows, unpainted wood, and asphalt siding.	+/-	The glass panels of the new sunroom addition are visually compatible with the existing home and historic district. However, the vertical metal siding is not a compatible material for the historic home and district. An alternative material that is more complementary of the surrounding traditional architecture would be more appropriate (see conditions of approval).
NC7	Design new construction to reinforce the human scale of historic districts where this is a character-defining feature.	+	These additions are setback from Franklin Street. They will be very visible in the alley, but it abuts the flood wall.
NC8	Design new construction in such a way that it does not disrupt important public views and vistas.	+	These additions are setback from Franklin Street. They will be very visible in the alley, but it abuts the flood wall.
NC9	Reinforce existing patterns of open space and enclosure, created by circulation routes, fences, walls, lawns, and allees of trees, in designs for new construction.	+/-	Most residential properties in the District are designed to have the main structure, private yard, and then possibly an accessory structure. However, this lot and others along this block of Franklin Street have slightly deeper front yards and smaller rear yards. This lot specifically already has additions and a garage in the rear, leaving a small portion of yard. The additions filling the rear yard, leaving little to no actual yard space, does not negatively impact this property or the District as a whole.
NC10	Design infill construction that reinforces the spatial organization established by surrounding buildings. The character of historic streetscapes relies heavily on the visual continuity established by the repetition of similarly-designed facades.	NA	Franklin Street streetscape will not be very impacted.
NC11	Design infill construction in such a way that the façade's organization closely relates to surrounding buildings. Window and door openings should be similar in size to their historic counterparts, as should the proportion of window to wall space. Cornice lines, columns, and storefronts are other important character-defining facade elements.	NA	Large rear additions rather than totally new infill.
NC12	Design new construction so that the building mass has a similar sense of lightness or weight as surrounding historic structures. Mass is determined by the proportion of solids (walls) to voids (window and door openings). Historic window proportions are generally two-and-one-half (height) by one (width).	+/-	The massing of the east side façade needs to be better articulated with either different cladding materials or different window openings to mitigate the scale (see conditions of approval).
NC13	Develop designs for new construction using windows that are sympathetic to the window patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportions, and muntin configurations is encouraged.	+/-	The remaining windows of the new addition, although more modern in design, complement the historic structure and surrounding structures in their placement and design.
NC14	Develop designs for new construction using front doors that are sympathetic to the door patterns of surrounding buildings. Use of comparable frame dimensions, proportion, and panel and light configuration is encouraged.	NA	

NC15	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main entrance is the same as the majority of other buildings on the street	NA	
NC16	Incorporate paved walks between sidewalks and the front entrances for new construction located on streets where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC17	Retain the character-defining features of a historic building when undertaking accessibility code-required work.	NA	
NC18	Investigate removable or portable ramps as options to providing barrier-free access.	NA	
NC19	Locate handicapped access ramps on secondary elevations wherever possible. If locating a ramp on the primary façade is required, it should be installed in a manner that does not damage historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.	NA	
NC20	Design infill construction so that it is compatible with the average height and width of surrounding buildings.	+	
NC21	Design new construction to have a floor-to-floor height that is within 10 percent of adjacent historic construction where the floor-to-floor height is relatively consistent, and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC22	Maintain the historic rhythm of the streetscape. The space between new construction and existing structures should fall within 20 percent of the average spacing for the block.	NA	
NC23	Maintain historic setback patterns. In order to maintain the continuity of the streetscape, setbacks for new construction should either match that of adjacent buildings where all share the same setback or be within 20 percent of neighboring structures in areas with varied setbacks.	NA	
NC24	Ensure that the roofs of new buildings relate to those of neighboring historic structures in pitch, complexity, and visual appearance of materials.	+	The flat and shed style roofs of the new additions speak to their modern design and will complement the diverse roofing styles of the surrounding structures.
NC25	Follow the precedent set by adjacent buildings when designing rooflines for infill construction. Where the predominant form is flat, built-up roofs are preferred. Where the predominant form is complex and steeply pitched, that is preferred. In blocks characterized by shallow-pitched roofs and pronounced overhangs with exposed rafters, these elements should be incorporated.	+/-	There is no set predominate roof form. There is a diverse set of roofing styles. The flat and shed style roofs will compliment.
NC26	Design new construction so that the orientation of the main roof form is parallel with the majority of other roofs on the street, where roof forms are relatively consistent and a character-defining feature.	+	
NC27	Design new construction to emphasize the existing cornice line on each block where this is a character-defining feature.	NA	
NC28	Integrate mechanical systems into new construction in such a way that rooftops remain uncluttered.	+	See conditions of approval

NC29	Make provisions for screening and storing trash receptacles when designing new construction.	+	See conditions of approval
NC30	Use an exterior sheathing that is similar to those of other surrounding historic buildings. While use of wood siding is preferred, vinyl siding may be used for new construction, but only in areas where the predominate historic construction material is wood.	+/-	The proposed vertical metal siding is not a similar or compatible material to those of other surrounding historic buildings. A different material that is more in-keeping with the traditional architecture of the surrounding buildings would be preferred.
NC31	Use masonry types and mortars that are similar to surrounding buildings in designs for new construction. Red brick is the most common masonry material found throughout the city's historic districts.	+/-	There is existing CMU garage that will remain and be incorporated into the design. The main shotgun house is masonry as well. The addition will be frame.
NC32	Incorporate stone or cast-stone sills and lintels into new construction designs on blocks where such elements are character-defining features.	NA	
NC33	Do not use modern "antiqued" brick in new construction.	NA	
NC34	Design new construction to have a raised masonry foundation, which is compatible in proportion and height with surrounding buildings. Foundation materials may be of a warm-toned poured concrete, split-face concrete block, or stuccoed concrete block that has a uniform, textured appearance.	+/-	The proposed foundation is compatible with the existing historic structure and surrounding structures.
NC35	Incorporate front porches on blocks where they are character-defining features. Design of new porches should be compatible with the form, scale, and detailing of surrounding buildings. On blocks where porch columns are prevalent, new columns should always consist of a base, shaft, and capital, and convey the appearance of actually holding up the porch roof.	NA	
NC36	Design porches on newly-constructed buildings so that the floor is even with or a maximum of one step below the corresponding floor of the house, the ceiling is even with that of adjacent rooms, the floor is at least 6' deep, the rhythm of the porch bays matches the facade's pattern of solids and voids, and the porch fascia board matches the height of the window head.	NA	
NC37	Design new garages or other secondary structures so that they complement the scale, roof form, setback, and materials of adjacent secondary structures.	+/-	The rear second-story additions are larger than adjacent secondary structures; however, the proposed additions will be attached to the primary structure. The surrounding structures along the street are diverse in size, scale, and massing.
NC38	Site new garages adjacent to alleys where present. Review the garage prototype insert that identifies styles appropriate to preservation districts when planning a garage construction project.	+	This is an existing condition with the garage off the rear alley. A second-story addition will be added to the existing garage.
NC39	Where no alleys exist, garages should be sited at the rear of the property behind the main house. Garage doors should not face the street, and access should be along the side yard. Landscape screening along the driveway is encouraged.	NA	
NC40	Use of smaller, single garage doors rather than expansive double or triple doors is preferred.	+/-	A double garage door already exists on the site. That size door is necessary for the turning radius of the small alley and flood wall.

NC41	Orient the roofline of a new garage so that it is parallel with the main house or follow the predominant pattern of existing secondary structures where such a pattern exists.	+	While the garage is existing, the second story addition on top will do this.
NC42	Roof pitch should be no less than one in six. Where the roof form of the main house is character-defining, owners are encouraged to echo the form of the main house.	+/-	The rear second-story addition will have a flat roof and the east side addition will have a shed roof. The proposed roofs will complement the existing gable roof of the main house.
NC43	Design new construction so that access to off-street parking is off alleys or secondary streets wherever possible.	+	This is an existing condition with the garage off the rear alley.
NC44	Incorporate storm-water management provisions into the design of new construction, so that any related runoff will not adversely impact nearby historic resources.	+	See conditions of approval

WINDOW

Design Guideline Checklist

+ Meets Guidelines
- Does Not Meet Guidelines
+/- Meets Guidelines with Conditions as Noted
NA Not Applicable
NSI Not Sufficient Information

	Guideline	Finding	Comment
W1	Replace severely deteriorated historic windows with new windows that convey the same visual appearance. Replacement windows may either be accurate reproductions using historical, pictorial, and physical documentation or be a new design that is compatible with the historic character of the building and the district. Use of vinyl- and aluminum-clad wood window systems on primary elevations may be permissible if the proportion and detail closely match the original.	NA	
W2	Select windows that match the historic sash dimension, muntin configuration, reveal depths, glass-to-frame ratios, glazing patterns, frame dimensions, trim profiles, and decorative features when repair of original windows is impossible.	NA	
W3	Evaluate the option of using appropriate salvage materials when replacing windows that are deteriorated beyond repair.	NA	
W4	Do not use replacement sash that does not fit historic window openings. Original openings should never be blocked-in to accommodate stock windows	NA	
W5	Do not install contemporary picture, glass block, or jalousie windows in exterior window openings.	NA	

W6	Do not install synthetic replacement windows (vinyl, etc.) on primary facades.	NA	
W7	Install replacement windows that operate in the same way as the original windows - double-hung windows are replaced with double-hung, and casement windows are replaced with casements.	NA	
W8	Do not replace multi-pane windows that have true divided lights with thermal glazing windows that have false "snap-in" or applied muntins on primary façade elevations.	NA	
W9	Do not apply reflective or insulating film to window glass.	+	See conditions of approval
W10	Do not use smoked, tinted, low-E, or reflective glass on building facades that can be seen from a public way.	+	See conditions of approval
W11	Use large sheets of clear glass when replacement of storefront display windows is required.	NA	
W12	Do not block-in or back-paint transoms or sidelights.	NA	
W13	Use surviving prototypes to reconstruct missing window elements, such as architraves, hoodmolds, sash, sills, and interior or exterior shutters and blinds. The reconstructed element should be constructed of materials for which there is a historic precedent or a compatible substitute material if that is not possible.	NA	
W14	Do not alter the number, size, location, or shape of original windows seen from a public way by making new window openings or permanently blocking existing openings. If windows are no longer needed, they should be shuttered if original shutters exist. If shutters do not exist, a temporary closure should be prepared, leaving the window frame intact.	+/-	The applicant proposes to brick over three windows on the west side elevation. Two of the windows appear to not be original to the home; however, the southernmost window should not be bricked in and shall remain as-is (see conditions of approval).
W15	Locate any new windows openings that may be required for a new use on a façade that cannot be seen from a public way. Newly-installed windows should be compatible with the overall design of the building.	NA	
W16	Do not obscure historic window trim with metal or siding material.	NA	
W17	Do not install new floors or dropped ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows. If such an approach is required, the design should incorporate setbacks that allow the full height of the window to be seen unobstructed.	NA	
W18	Install exterior storm windows that duplicate the shape of the original window. Storm windows should be painted to match the color of the window frame.	NA	
W19	Do not install exterior storm windows or screens that damage or obscure historic windows or frames. Mount storm windows on the blind stop within the window frame. Storm window or screen rails should always match the rails of the windows behind. They should have either wood or narrow, metal frames that are painted to match the color of the building trim.	NA	

W20	Do not install window air conditioning units on a primary façade if installation on a secondary façade can address the same need. If this is not an option, do not alter the window sash to accommodate the air-conditioning unit.	NA	
W21	Install any security bars in such a way that they do not obscure the architectural character of original windows or damage historic fabric. Commercial security grills should retract out of sight during business hours.	NA	
W22	Design awnings to complement existing architectural features. They should not overwhelm the façade.	NA	
W23	Install awnings made of weather-proofed canvas of a traditional form. Fiberglass, metal, plastic, and back-lit awnings that have contemporary shapes are inappropriate and visually intrusive.	NA	
W24	Select an awning color that complements the building, with solid colors and narrow or wide stripes running perpendicular to the building being the preferred patterns.	NA	
W25	Install awnings in a way that does not harm the building. Hardware installation should be limited to that which is required for structural stability and should be driven into mortar joints rather than into masonry.	NA	
W26	Attach awnings between the window display area and the signboard or second-floor window sills. Awnings should be attached below the transom line where historic prism glass is present and building scale allows.	NA	
W27	Install awnings so that the valance is no lower than 7' above the sidewalk.	NA	
W28	Repair shutters with in-kind materials. If damage is so extensive that they cannot be repaired, replacement shutters should match the visual appearance of the originals.	NA	
W29	Install shutters only where there is historic evidence for them. Replacement shutters should be or appear to be operable, measure the full height and width of the windows, and be constructed of a historically-appropriate material. Solid shutters are appropriate for the ground floor, and solid or louvered shutters are appropriate for upper floors.	NA	
W30	Mount replacement shutters so that they partially cover the vertical trim of the window frame. This gives shutters the appearance that they are indeed operable, even if in truth they are not. Shutters should not be applied to the masonry or cladding on either side of the window.	NA	
W31	Do not install aluminum or vinyl shutters.	NA	
W32	Photographically document architectural features that are slated for reconstruction prior to the removal of any historic fabric.	+	The applicant has submitted photographs of the proposed alterations prior to reconstruction.